

2nd Meeting of the GRAF Expert Group

Summary Notes and Outcomes

08-09 November 2018 | Salle C2, WMO – Geneva

November 8

Opening Comments

Mami Mizutori, UNISDR SRSG welcomed Experts, thanked them for their participation, contribution and energy and highlighted the imperative to turn that energy into outcomes. She noted that while there is great promise to GRAF, that if it is not met with commitment, action and production, it will quickly lose relevance and momentum. She noted the challenge for UNISDR as Secretariat in light of many other commitments and resource constraints and thanked those experts who had already contributed resources and support.

Session 1: Operational Design and Expert Group Terms of Reference

Breakout Group: TOR of the Expert Group: Discussion surrounding purpose, priorities, membership and the basis for the creation of new or dissolution of existing Working Groups, handover/continuity and relationship with the Secretariat and Working Groups.

OUTCOME: [Expert Michael Obersteiner](#) has committed to sharing an edited draft that incorporates all breakout group comments with the Secretariat **by end of November 2018**. The Secretariat will make final edits and share with the broader Expert Group for final comments before it is made official.

Breakout Group: Operating Model: The draft operating model drafted in June 2018 as a point of departure is largely agreed to be flexible, dynamic and responsive to the probable needs and purposes of the Framework. “We need some case studies and examples to imagine scenarios of connection to this; organizations wanting to join, etc. and road test whether this would work. The document is flexible, but it is hard to touch.” The group was unable to discuss aspects of resource mobilization and funding in detail – it is expected that a dedicated group of experts will be formed to address this in the period to April 2019.

OUTCOME: The Operating Model needs a 1-page, simplified explanation. This to be tasked to the [Working Group: Communication and IT for clearance at the 3rd Meeting of the GRAF Expert Group \(EG3\) in April 2019](#).

OUTCOME: To know whether this model will serve the purposes of the GRAF in a practical sense it needs to be road-tested by [members of the Expert Group and the Secretariat](#) to see how they, their institutions, partners or stakeholders would link. First phase road-testing to be complete **by the end of February 2019**.

Session 2: Operationalization of the GRAF Working Groups

Presentation of pre-WG scoping, the status of development, activity and organization of the four preliminary Working Groups as articulated in the GRAF Concept Note.

- Secretariat Rhea Katsanakis on the status of the WG: Demonstrators and Pilots
- Invited Guest Laura Lee presented preliminary scoping and design principles for the development of both the WG: Fostering Interdisciplinary Systems Thinking and the GRAF writ large, with practical demonstration of systems thinking applied to the Multiple Breadbasket Failure Initiative by Invited Guest Franziska Gaupp. These guests highlighted that we are seeking solutions to complex and seemingly intractable problems through systems thinking approaches and that new forms of collaborative action and collective intelligence are gaining traction and having impact on global and local scales.
- Secretariat Jeremy Hindle on the WG: Mapping and Gap Analysis

Breakout Group Communications and IT: This group had challenges because a lot of the targeting requires information from the WG: Mapping and Gap Analysis (MAGA) and outcomes that will be discussed on Day 2 of this meeting. That said, this group identified 3 possible products: an internal communication tool, a public-facing website and a decision-support tool (though the definition and form of this tool was not settled in the group discussion).

OUTCOME: [Secretariat](#) to investigate off-the-shelf solutions for internal communications and will share with the WG: Comms & IT for suitability and next steps **by 05 Dec 2018**.

OUTCOME: A web presence describing what GRAF and who is involved. [Secretariat](#) to investigate options for using PreventionWeb platform and will report to WG: Comms & IT **by 15 January 2018**.

OUTCOME: External communications products including: Twitter/ Elevator/ 1-pager/ broader TPs, infographics and SRSG speech at GP19. [Communications WG: Comms & IT](#) to develop first three items **by 30 November 2018**.

OUTCOME: [Some members of this WG](#) will join the meetings of the other WGs as observers on behalf of WG: Comms & IT to explain needs and extract information from outcomes of those groups.

OUTCOME: ToR of the WG to be developed prior to launching the Call for Expressions of Interest (including selection criteria for members). [Leaders of WG: Comms & IT](#) **by 30 November 2018**.

Breakout Group Fostering Interdisciplinary Systems Thinking: WG will be strong with a hybrid of EG and non-EG members. Focus on 'fostering', not mastering systems thinking.

OUTCOME: **In Feb 2019**, [Climate KIC](#) will host a workshop that will produce a value statement and build on progress from the November FIST meeting in Torino. This will demonstrate 3 dimensions of impact (cross-sector, cross-scale and cross-risk dimension with real examples).

OUTCOME: ToR of the WG to be developed prior to launching the Call for Expressions of Interest (including selection criteria for members). [Leaders of WG: FIST by 15 December 2018](#).

OUTCOME: [Working Group members](#) to collect and curate demonstrations of Systems-approaches (MBBF, Avian Flu analysis, Systemic Risk in Financial systems in Mexico, NYT/FT, Oxford) [by 7 March 2019](#).

OUTCOME: Establish a sandbox collaboration space – [Unattributed](#).

Breakout Group Mapping and Gap Analysis: We are good at mapping risk but not great at vulnerability or risk preferences. We need to define an action plan and develop a catalogue of what there is already (data ecosystem including sources / organisations, initiatives / user requirements / user road testing); what is missing is organization. One expert indicated willingness to lead this WG, an additional expert is required.

OUTCOME: [Expert John Schneider](#) committed to developing draft TORs for this WG [by 15 December 2018](#) with the support of [Secretariat Jeremy Hindle](#).

OUTCOME: [Experts](#) committed to developing draft Project Plans for the mapping requirements by [9 December 2018](#) with support from [Secretariat Jeremy Hindle](#).

OUTCOME: Ground-truth user cases, scenarios and needs [by EG3 in April 2019](#). [Unattributed](#) – proposed that [all experts](#) conduct real world validation of at least two of the user cases from the appendix of the Concept Note.

OUTCOME: ToR of the WG to be developed prior to launching the Call for Expressions of Interest (including selection criteria for members). [Leaders of WG: MAGA by 30 November 2018](#).

Breakout Group Demonstrators and Pilots: Discussion around whether the work of this group should be focused on pushing new models or attracting (pulling) examples from outside. It was agreed that all demonstrators should adhere to GRAF Principles and objectives per the Concept Note. Projects should be demand-driven responses to user needs (link to WG: MAGA). This group could create inventories of models with some commentary about their utility and limitations.

Several new demonstrators were identified and proponents have agreed to present their ideas to the WG: Demonstrators and Pilots.

OUTCOME: ToR of the WG to be developed prior to launching the Call for Expressions of Interest (including selection criteria for members). [Leaders of WG: D&P by 15 December 2018 for review and clearance by the Expert Group](#).

OUTCOME: This WG will develop protocols for reviewing and selecting activities presented for consideration as pilots and demonstrators (evaluating adherence of projects to the GRAF principles and objectives). Potentially to be included in the ToR - [Unattributed](#).

Closing Remarks

Secretariat Ricardo Mena “In most cases the time allotted did not permit the drafting of the TORs, nor conclusion with a product and/or specific activities. This is an area where we need more concrete development. The way forward is an area that will need some volunteers to do some homework to get this finalized in the next 10 days.”

November 9

Session 3: Planning for the Future

Breakout Group: Intra-GRAF Communications:

OUTCOME: [Secretariat](#) to create contact list of Expert Group Members and Working Group affiliations, identify email management (mailing lists?) options, explore document management options and programme management tools **by 30 November 2018**.

Breakout: External GRAF Communications: Thinking of risk beyond disaster risk. Governments don't have the same level of risk acceptance as the communities living in at-risk areas. While the latter are often aware of the risk, assume it anyway – for political reasons, perception, absence of other options, etc. Must include everyone and everything; the WG could establish a hub/ a community of practice/ the intellectual core of which is in the business of cognitive science or risk communication.

It will be imperative to ensure GRAF understands the culture of users/ people, how they think and behave (in light of this) before GRAF determines how to communicate with them (i.e. before it develops a strategy of communication).

OUTCOME: [Secretariat](#) to identify and hire a full time External Communications Specialist. This person would focus on content development (text, imagery, tweets, documents, speaking notes for SRSG and other ambassadors of GRAF, manage demand/ interest generated, including at/ following the GP 2019, and prepare the launch event at the Global Platform. Experts to support resource mobilisation for onboarding **by March 2019**.

OUTCOME: [Secretariat](#) to establish PreventionWeb-based online presence in preliminary stages **before end 2018**.

OUTCOME: [Experts Shanna McClain and Costis Toregas](#) to convene a teleconference to discuss online content and a mock-up of website **by 21 Jan 2019**.

Breakout: Risk Communication: GRAF is a way of thinking instead of a data aggregation tool. GRAF should be open and inclusive, with a strong capacity to connect, including across systems, fostering systems-based thinking and working.

OUTCOME: [Expert Lisa Robinson](#) to continue existing conversations with external partners about the formation of a hub to advance risk communication. This will be subject to consultation with the Secretariat and WG: Communication & IT about how this may be connected with the GRAF **by end January 2019**.

OUTCOME: [Expert Costis Toregas](#) to write first draft and [Expert Lisa Robinson](#) to draft a WG: Communications & IT TOR which includes activities, profile of membership, selection criteria, time-commitment, timelines, etc. This to be shared with [Secretariat](#) for inputs and circulated to the broader [Working Group](#) for feedback **by end of November 2018**.

Session 4: Operationalization and Sustainability

Experts identified the need to have deliverables and plans, accompanied by an estimation of the preliminary resources required for delivery by EG3, by the GP19 Launch, by EG4 in November 2019, with mechanisms for follow-up in place immediately. Resources to be made available to GRAF operationalisation include: Expert Group members time, expertise, partnerships and networks; infrastructure; funding; hosting/ convening meetings. Map activities, budget and collectively mobilise resources. Each group outlined what already exists.

< continued next page >

OUTCOME (if not specified elsewhere):

Working Group	Led by / Responsible	Action	Due by
	M. Obersteiner & Secretariat	Finalisation and diffusion of Expert Group TOR	30.11.2018
	Secretariat + Working Group Communications & IT	Template / 'minimum' elements for Working Group TORs	23.11.2018
	All Working Group Leads (WGL) with Working Groups (WGs)	WG TOR (including selection criteria for members)	15.12.2018
	Secretariat	Call for Expression of Interest to join GRAF WGs	01-14.12.2018
	Secretariat & Expert Group (EG)	Selection of GRAF WG members	31.12.2018
	All WGs + V. del Rio Vilas & W. Moufouma-Okia	Draft of the Implementation Roadmap 2029 for EG3	03.03.2019
	Secretariat & WG Leads	Draft resource mobilization strategy	01.02.2019
	Secretariat	Organization of the 3 rd Meeting of the Expert Group	03.04.2019
Demonstrators and Pilots	D. Whitaker & T. de Groeve	Designing a questionnaire and a process for diversity	31.12.2018 (tbc)
Demonstrators and Pilots	D. Whitaker & T. de Groeve	Diffusion of calls for Expressions of Interest / Vetting and Selection	05.12.2018 - 01.02.2019
Demonstrators and Pilots	D. Whitaker & T. de Groeve	Definition of criteria for selection of pilots and demonstrators	31.12.2018
Demonstrators and Pilots	D. Whitaker & T. de Groeve	Identify new work that can be done and that would be available	31.12.2018 (tbc)
Demonstrators and Pilots	D. Whitaker & T. de Groeve	WB baseline data project	03.03.2019 (tbc)
Demonstrators and Pilots	D. Whitaker & T. de Groeve	What resources are available that we can identify as GRAF-connected	03.03.2019 (tbc)
Demonstrators and Pilots	D. Whitaker & T. de Groeve	Development of at least 2 selected pilots	01.04.2019
FIST	S. Williams & A. Ruane	Systems thinking in the development of the pilots & demonstrators	21.12.2018 (tbc)
FIST	S. Williams	Value statement for system thinking and link to GAR ch4	15.12.2018
FIST	S. Williams & A. Ruane	Create a hybrid group	25.01.2019 (tbc)
FIST	S. Williams & A. Ruane	Demonstration projects of how systems thinking bridges across the GRAF Impact Cube	03.03.2019
FIST	S. Williams	Across sectors - Climate-KIC	03.02.2019
FIST	A. Ruane	Across scales - AgMIP, local farms	03.03.2019
FIST	N. Shindo	Across Risk - WHO around Cholera.	03.03.2019
FIST	S. Williams & A. Ruane	Systemic Risk Demo (MBBF, finance, avian flu, USAF, Systemic Risk in Financial systems in Mexico, NYT-FT, Oxford)	07.03.2019
FIST	S. Williams & A. Ruane	Risk perspective and risk preferences sandbox to explore	03.03.2019 (tbc)
Communications and IT	C. Toregas	Twitter/ Elevator/ 1-pager/ broader TPs/ SRSg speech	30.11.2018
Communications and IT	Secretariat with S. McClain	Mock-up of website	15.12.2018
Communications and IT	Secretariat	Public Website (interim on PreventionWeb)	15.01.2019
Communications and IT	C. Toregas & L. Robinson	Communications Homework External Facing	30.11.2018
Communications and IT	S. McClain	Content, text, imagery, to transfer into larger platform	21.01.2019
Communications and IT	Secretariat	Intra-GRAF, group, email mgmt, doc mgmt, prog management	05.12.2018
Communications and IT	J. Schneider & EG members	Road testing of Operating Model	27.02.2019
Communications and IT	S. Williams & J. Schneider	Finalisation and diffusion of Operating Model	27.03.2019
Communications and IT	Secretariat + input from WG Comms & IT, & EG members	Global Platform Scenario, including launch/ Working Session, SRSg messaging and pre-/post- communications	05.12.2018 - 16.05.2019
Communications and IT	L. Robinson	External consultation about the risk communication hub	31.01.2019
Mapping and Gap Analysis	J. Hindle & D. Whitaker	Inventory for Mapping and Gap analysis	31.12.2018
Mapping and Gap Analysis	N. Aldaoud, J. Schneider & J. Hindle	Draft Project Plans for mapping requirements	09.12.2018
Mapping and Gap Analysis	J. Hindle & J. Schneider	Questionnaire to EG (to map EG networks and new members)	09.12.2018
Mapping and Gap Analysis	J. Hindle & J. Schneider	Mapping data ecosystem including data, tools, sources, organisations, initiatives	03.03.2019
Mapping and Gap Analysis	EG members & Secretariat	Ground-truth user cases, scenarios and needs	03.03.2019
Mapping and Gap Analysis	J. Hindle & J. Schneider	Identifying data needs, gap analysis	03.04.2019
Mapping and Gap Analysis	STAG Data WG, A. Collins	'Hidden' data, 'impact' data, decision quality, barriers to data access	03.04.2019
Mapping and Gap Analysis		Project – Data ecosystem & User road test:	
	M. Obersteiner & F. Gaupp	- IIASA, MBBF	03.03.2019
	P. Ward	- GFP, flood risk	03.03.2019
	S. Ramage	- GEO, Data cube	03.03.2019
	J. Schneider	- GEM	03.03.2019
	J. Karba & UNECE	- UNECE, TEIA gap analysis	03.03.2019

Secretariat Ricardo Mena issued an open call to the Expert Group for targeted and dedicated assistance (in-kind contribution of time or other direct support) in realising the GRAF Delivery Plan and to ensure the productive accomplishment of the tasks outlined in Session 4. The Secretariat invited Expert Group members to self-nominate via email. Ricardo thanked experts who agreed to co-lead WGs.

Session 5: Next Steps and Way Forward

Experts identified the need to figure out how to integrate big data and AI within the co-design and development of GRAF in a manner supportive of the implementation of the Sendai Framework – stating that this should be a focus at the Global Platform (GP) in May 2019.

GRAF must be accessible to non-scientists – bringing users along in the co-design process; recognising that while the ideas underpinning GRAF are not yet mature, GRAF must show value and progress.

In confirming commitment to the roll-out of the GRAF Delivery Plan, the Expert Group identified the need to build the Implementation Roadmap 2029 - with a draft for review in Q1 2019 by Expert Group members, and for discussion and finalisation at EG3 in April 2019.

OUTCOME: [Experts Victor del Rio Vilas and Wilfran Moufouma-Okia](#) to consult with experts in WGs and the Expert Group in the development of a draft of the Implementation Roadmap 2029 for review by the GRAF Expert Group in Q1 2019 and finalisation **at the 3rd Meeting of the GRAF Expert Group in April 2019.**

OUTCOME: [Secretariat with WG Communications & IT](#) to write and distribute a template for Working Groups, including standard text and parameters for WG TORs **by 30 November 2018.**

OUTCOME: [Secretariat](#) to consult Expert Group members on possible dates for the 3rd Meeting of the GRAF Expert Group – provisionally 3-4 April 2019 – and agree dates **by 30 November 2018.**

Session 6: Closing

SRSG Mami Mizutori

The SRSG expressed her gratitude and welcomed the fact that the work of the experts had covered so many issues, each underpinned by intense discussion. The SRSG expressed her pleasure that so many of the things required for GRAF operationalisation were coming together and together and was reassured and pleased with both the magnitude and detail of the commitments made by the experts.

She emphasised the importance of what will be presented and discussed about the GRAF at the GP – reminding experts of the number and diversity of key stakeholders that will be in attendance. As the GP represents a key milestone in appraising progress in achieving the outcome, goal and targets of the Sendai Framework, the SRSG advised experts of the importance of framing the GRAF as one of the key efforts supporting the implementation of the framework, as well as the 2030 Agenda, the Paris Agreement and the New Urban Agenda.

She welcomed the commitment to the rapid realisation of foundational documents, establishment of GRAF Working Groups, as well as agreement on language and the presentation of concept, and reminded the meeting that with the GP fast approaching that these must be done in the shortest time possible.

In describing the ambition and multi-dimensionality of the GRAF, the SRSG expressed satisfaction at the progress made, and underlined the importance of continuing to grow the collaboration between the Secretariat and the Expert Group, as well as future members of Working Groups and collaborators. While the commitments of experts are imperative for GRAF operationalisation, the ability of the GRAF collaborative to generate the funding required for Phase II of the Theory of Change – whether from national governments or other – will depend in no small part on the launch at the GP in May 2019. It will be here that governments will be convinced, or not, of the value of supporting the GRAF. Recognising that the resources required for operationalisation and development of the GRAF exceed those currently available, the SRSG reaffirmed her – and the Secretariat’s – commitment to fund raise, as part of a collective undertaking with GRAF Expert Group members.

UNISDR Director Kirsi Madi:

Welcomed the considerable progress made in the 2nd Meeting of the GRAF Expert Group and expressed her gratitude to experts for their energy and commitment to the operationalisation of GRAF.