

# **Moving Mountains**

## **A United Nations Assessment of Development Challenges in Tajikistan**



## **Common Country Assessment for Tajikistan**

<b>CCA Tajikistan Country Profile .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Executive Summary .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>I. Introduction .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>II. Analysis.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>A. Governance.....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>B. Poverty .....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>C. People in need of special protection .....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>D. Education.....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>E. Gender .....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>F. Health.....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>G. Environment.....</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>H. Regional Cooperation.....</b>	<b>31</b>
<b>III. Areas of Cooperation .....</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>IV. Indicator Framework .....</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>V. Sources .....</b>	<b>42</b>

## CCA Tajikistan Country Profile

<b>Independence</b>	9 September 1991
<b>Territory</b>	143,100 km <sup>2</sup> ; population density 44.3 / km <sup>2</sup>
<b>Population</b>	6.3 million 1.7 million (27%) urban; 4.6 million (73%) rural 0-19 years 3.3 million (52%)
<b>Administrative divisions</b>	
<i>Dushanbe (capital)</i>	0.6 million inhabitants
<i>Direct Rule Districts (DRD)</i>	28,700km <sup>2</sup> ; 1.4 million inhabitants
<i>Gorno-Badakhshan Autonomous Oblast (GBAO)</i>	63,700km <sup>2</sup> ; 0.2 million inhabitants
<i>Khatlon Oblast</i>	24,600km <sup>2</sup> ; 2.2 million inhabitants
<i>Sughd Oblast</i>	26,100km <sup>2</sup> ; 1.9 million inhabitants
<b>Ethnic structure</b>	80% Tajik; 15.3% Uzbek, 1.1% Russian, 3.6% other nationalities
<b>National currency</b>	Somoni (US\$ 1 ~ 3.2 Somoni, June 2003)
<b>Nominal GDP</b>	US\$ 1 billion
<b>GDP growth, 1998 to 2001</b>	7% average annually
<b>Agriculture (% of GDP)</b>	27%
<b>Industry (% of GDP)</b>	27%
<b>Services (% of GDP)</b>	47%
<b>Tax revenues (% of GDP)</b>	14.0%
<b>State budget revenues (% of GDP)</b>	15.2%
<b>State budget expenditures (% of GDP)</b>	15.0%
<i>% of GDP spent on education</i>	2.6% (2002)
<i>% of GDP spent on health</i>	1.0%
<b>Official Development Assistance (2002)</b>	US\$ 205 million
<b>Exports</b>	US\$ 652 million
<b>Imports</b>	US\$ 773 million
<b>External debt / GDP</b>	98%
<b>GDP per capita</b>	US\$ 170 US\$ 1,152 in PPP terms (2000)
<b>Average monthly salary</b>	US\$ 10.6
<b>Cost of consumption basket</b>	US\$ 11.7
<b>Life expectancy</b>	66.1/male and 70.8/female
<b>Total fertility rate</b>	3.9 children per woman
<b>Infant mortality rate</b>	89 deaths per 1,000 live births
<b>Maternal mortality rate</b>	50.6 deaths per 100,000 live births
<b>Water potential</b>	Tajikistan provides 55% of annual flow into Aral Basin
<b>Access to piped water (2002)<sup>1</sup></b>	56% overall 30% of rural population
<b>Human development index (2001)</b>	0.667(113 <sup>th</sup> of 175) 151 <sup>st</sup> of 173 in terms of GDP per capita

Sources: PRSP, ACU, IMF, CAS, MICS, SSC

<sup>1</sup> Note that piped water does not automatically imply “safe water.”

## Acronyms

ABA	American Bar Association
ADB	Asian Development Bank
AKF	Aga Khan Foundation
CADA	Central Asian Development Agency
CAS	Country Assistance Strategy (World Bank)
CAT	Convention Against Torture
CEDAW	Convention for the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CERD	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
DCA	Drug Control Agency
DOTS	Directly Observed Therapy, Short-term
DRD	Direct Rule Districts
EBRD	European Bank for Reconstruction and Development
ESCAP	Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific
ESI	Environment and Security Initiative
FAO	UN Food and Agricultural Organisation
GBAO	Gorno-Badakhshan Autonomous Oblast
GIS	Geographic Information Systems
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
IDU	Injecting Drug Users
IFAS	International Fund to Save the Aral Sea
IFES	International Foundation for Election Systems
IFRC	International Federation of the Red Cross
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IOM	International Organization for Migration
ILO	International Labour Organization
LBD	Live-Birth Definition
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MICS	Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey
NESDP	National Education Sector Development Plan
OCHA	United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
ODA	Official Development Assistance
OECD	Organization for Economic Development and Cooperation
OSCE	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe
OSI	Open Society Institute
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
REACT	Rapid Emergency Assessment and Co-ordination Team
REAP	Regional Environmental Action Plan
SDC	Swiss Development Corporation
SPECA	UN Special Programme for the Economies of Central Asia
STI	Sexually Transmitted Infection(s)
TLSS	Tajikistan Living Standard Survey
UNAIDS	Joint UN HIV/AIDS programme
UNCBD	UN Convention on Biodiversity
UNCCD	UN Convention to Combat Desertification.
UNDP	UN Development Programme
UNECE	UN Economic Commission for Europe
UNESCO	UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNFCCC	UN Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNFPA	UN Population Fund
UNHCR	UN High Commissioner for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNIFEM	United Nations Development Fund for Women
UNODC	UN Office on Drugs and Crime
UNTOP	UN Tajikistan Office for Peacekeeping
WB	World Bank
WFP	World Food Programme
WHO	World Health Organization
WSSD	World Summit on Sustainable Development
WTO	World Trade Organization

## **Executive Summary**

In consultation with the Government and national and international NGOs, the UN System in Tajikistan initiated this assessment in early 2003, as the first step in designing a framework for the UN's development assistance for 2005 to 2009. This assessment has been closely linked to the 2002 Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper and the MDG report, and is the outcome of a joint process involving all twelve member organizations of the UN family resident in Tajikistan,<sup>2</sup> eight non-resident agencies and key Government and NGO partners.

Causal analysis and the participatory writing of this paper yielded five development challenges that lie at the heart of all eight sectors covered in this assessment. They are:

1. Increased access – to information, decision-making, services, resources and assets;
2. Institutional reform – to promote efficiency, transparency and inclusiveness;
3. Decentralization – to enhance cohesion and accountability;
4. Capacity building – to strengthen professionalism, leadership and employable skills; and
5. Data analysis and evaluation – to improve policy planning and implementation.

The transitions from an authoritarian communist regime to pluralism and a market economy and from civil war to a rule-based, inclusive civil order are complicated. Tajikistan is also fragmented in geographical, political and economical terms. The five-year civil war that ended in 1997 and the drought in 2000/2001 are among the many factors that have slowed the development process. Tajikistan's geographic isolation is aggravated by instability, low capacity or unfriendliness in neighbouring countries. The emigration of thousands of qualified specialists has further weakened the administrative and leadership capacity.

While there are many challenges to overcoming declines in the lives of the people, the pivotal factor is poverty. More than 80% of the population live in poverty and a third of the workforce (up to 900,000 people) migrate for economic reasons every year. Local authorities' influence on land use and agricultural production, low salaries, poor nutrition, and deteriorating health standards are mutually reinforcing. With falling school quality and attendance – as well as a growing trend of youth turning to drugs – the country faces the risk of a lost generation.

Efficiency of state institutions is hampered by low capacity. With 24 line ministries and four layers of government institutions, the impact of unclear mandates, poor coordination, and shortage of funds is severe. Weak policy development is also apparent in local government, due in part to the continued centralization of decision-making.

Human rights violations occur throughout all sectors of state and society and constitutional guarantees are poorly implemented. Police operations still bear authoritarian characteristics. There are concerns about the independence, capacity, and adequacy of the justice system. Massive amounts of drugs transit through from Afghanistan, creating serious security concerns and contributing to a large shadow economy.

Bureaucratic hurdles, complex tax codes, lack of capital, state monopolies and strong vested interests hinder the development of legitimate small and medium enterprises (SMEs). The absence of solid data and analytical capacity impedes sound monitoring and evaluation of activities in the economic and finance spheres. Developing the banking sector and increasing sources for domestic finance are crucial for strengthening the private sector.

Reform of the legislative and judicial branches of Government and of Customs and border control, the banking system, and registration systems (voter, birth, land and others) will increase transparency and improve overall governance. Participation by women in Parliament, local government and civil society should be increased. Parliament's lack of interaction with the public and the limited competencies of local assemblies contribute to a considerable shortfall in the exchange of information.

---

<sup>2</sup> FAO, IMF, OCHA, ODC, UNDP, UNFPA, UNHCR, UNICEF, UNTOP, WFP, WHO, World Bank.

Land use and ownership must be reformed, as improved agricultural practices provide a sound prospect for sustainable growth and poverty reduction. All land is currently state-owned and land use rights are passed on only through inheritance. Key issues in agriculture are low productivity, government interference and the lack of markets. Tajikistan still relies on substantial amounts of food aid. Food purchases may consume up to 80% of household income, curtailing access to such needs as healthcare and education.

Food insecurity at the household level is linked to what happens in institutional, physical and transportation infrastructures, the management and use of water resources, agriculture, and access to markets. Only 30% of the rural population have access to a piped water system. Water supply systems are unsafe, unreliable and inefficient due to lack of maintenance. Water-related diseases are common. Water tariffs need to be raised and the public needs education on more responsible use of this precious resource.

Inadequate energy, transport, telecommunications, and water supply infrastructure directly affect the poor by decreasing access to goods and services, jobs, information, health care and education. The poor often also have very limited access to information on prices, markets, laws, and social services.

Especially vulnerable groups include youth; female-headed households; children and adults with disabilities; children and adults in institutions; the elderly; food-insecure households; and children who are not registered at birth. These are marginalized populations whose rights are curtailed by obsolete, centralized systems that rely on state institutional response rather than community-based alternatives.

Greater commitment by the Government and donors are re-energizing the education system but a projected 50% increase by 2015 in the number of school-age children will hit an already stretched education sector. The poor physical condition of most schools, inadequate training of teachers, outdated curricula and lack of teaching and learning materials require increased participation by parents and communities, decentralized decision-making and management, and improved data collection and analysis.

Tajikistan used to rank with middle upper-income countries in terms of the major health indicators. Today, high infant, under-5 and maternal mortality rates and increasing prevalence of malaria, tuberculosis, measles and other diseases must be dealt with.

In 2003, the authorities are still confident that less than 1% of the population is HIV-positive – this is a unique and fleeting opportunity. With HIV/AIDS and other infectious diseases on the rise, improved surveillance methods, access and user-friendly services are vital for everyone, particularly the at-risk groups such as IDUs, youth and women.

Though the Constitution provides for full equality, in practice women do not enjoy the same rights as men. They are often seen as service- and income-providers to families. Participation of women in higher government structures dropped after independence, but the increasing participation of women in civil society is encouraging. Gender-based violence is starting to be recognized as a social problem.

Inefficient environmental governance, lack of interest and knowledge among the population and the direct link between poverty and natural resource degradation, make it unlikely that Tajikistan will attain the MDG on environmental sustainability. Nonetheless, proper management of fresh water, irrigation, and hydropower could become a major growth factor for Tajikistan and its downstream neighbours.

As Tajikistan is prone to natural disasters, preparedness and mitigation programmes need to be enhanced.

Throughout the CCA development process, as root and underlying causes were identified and cross-referenced, it became clear that the issues of access, reform, decentralization, capacity and data must be addressed adequately for the country to make substantial progress toward the MDGs. The UN will work with both Government and civil society to ensure that they are tackled with firmness and resolve, ensuring that *human rights, human security (conflict prevention and resolution) and gender sensitivity* are present in all the programming and implementation.

## **I. Introduction**

*There is hope in the absence of hope,  
Just as there is light at the end of the blackest night.  
(Nizomee Ganjavee)*

Tajikistan's already complex transition from highly centralized governance with almost complete reliance on Moscow for trade, budget transfers and policy planning, to sudden independence was exacerbated by a civil conflict that left 50,000 dead and caused US\$ 7 billion damage. Natural disasters, including the devastating 2000/2001 drought, compounded economic and political instability and the security situation remained precarious until the end of 2001.

The year 2002 was a turning point for Tajikistan. Government, civil society and the international community recognized that the time had come to move beyond humanitarian assistance and the emergency mentality that goes with it. The phase-out of the Consolidated Appeal Process<sup>3</sup> and of important emergency actors such as MSF, are signs that development, rather than crisis management and response, is the main thrust for future programming in the country.

The country's resilient people face a powerful set of challenges. Land-locked, 93% mountainous and largely barren, Tajikistan is fragmented in terms of geography, ethnic identities, politics and the economy. The emigration of large numbers of qualified personnel, even before the conflict broke out, left the country with weak administrative and leadership capacity. The civil war was just one of a range of exacerbating factors. Its neighbour to the north, Uzbekistan, has become more restrictive and unaccommodating. Its neighbour to the south, Afghanistan, has not yet moved beyond two decades of conflict and is the origin of large quantities of drugs that travel through Tajikistan. Incomes and tax revenues are low and domestic investment is non-existent. Most investment financing comes from abroad and with sovereign debt at almost 100% of GDP, further loans are not a sustainable option.

Poverty is a threat to Tajikistan's human capital. Low incomes, poor nutrition, and deteriorating health standards are mutually reinforcing. School attendance is falling; youth are increasingly turning to drugs and are thus risking HIV infection; if these trends are not reversed, the country faces the risk of a lost generation. With more than half the population under 18 and birth rates persistently high, this prospect is particularly daunting.

Sustainable solutions will come through improved household incomes, small-scale, privatized agriculture, and SMEs. While a major shift of attitudes away from a command economy is required of both entrepreneurs and the population, the Government must strive to facilitate rather than control business. Much remains to be done to establish clarity and reliability in the legal framework, i.e., on registration, taxation and labour and environmental standards, and in law enforcement. Rent seeking and corruption can only be tackled through transparency and accountability throughout the administration.

As can be seen in the overall improvement in the security situation and to some extent in the political context, Tajikistan has made progress. The support of the international community, both in increased funding and closer contacts with the Government and civil society, has grown considerably in the past two years. The number of resident embassies and organizations' country offices has risen, while the aid programmes of bilateral and multilateral donors have expanded. The May 2003 meeting of the Consultative Group resulted in pledges totalling US\$ 900 million over a three-year period, including humanitarian and technical assistance. Increases in financial and technical support must be matched by strengthened coordination and long-term strategic planning, led by the Government's Aid Coordination Unit, the Department for Economic Reforms and Investment and the PRSP Unit.

Present in Tajikistan since 1993, UN operations were at first dedicated mostly to humanitarian activities and support to the peace process. Even in the early years, however, UN agencies carried out programmes aimed at long-term development. With the official end of the civil war in 1997, the UN stepped up its presence. By 2002, 12 agencies were resident<sup>4</sup> and 8 more had projects but no offices in the country. In the two-year period from 2001 to mid-2003, the UN system brought close to US\$ 163 million into Tajikistan.

---

<sup>3</sup> A final CAP has been submitted for 2004.

<sup>4</sup> FAO, IMF, OCHA, ODC, UNDP, UNFPA, UNHCR, UNICEF, UNTOP, WFP, WHO, World Bank.

In this ongoing transition from humanitarian to development planning, UN agencies initiated the MDG and CCA process, working with the Government. Building on the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP), which was completed in 2002, the Government produced its first MDG Report as a means to focus assistance on the development goals established by the UN General Assembly for 2015. This corresponds with the UN system's commitment to UN reform and to the CCA and UNDAF processes in particular. The underlying principle is that the development operations of the UN system in Tajikistan share common objectives and strategies.

The linkages between the PRSP, the MDG Report, the CCA and the UNDAF span the spectrum of development challenges. Completing the three latter processes in a single year has been an advantage for greater cohesion to be achieved. On the downside, the tight timeframe has meant that there has been less room for a broad participatory process.

The MDG Report and the CCA processes began in earnest in January 2003. The Government established four working groups to assess progress towards achieving the MDGs. UN staff members participated actively in their work. The UN Country Team established eight CCA working groups on Governance, Poverty, Vulnerable Populations, Gender, Education, Health, Environment and Regional Cooperation. The CCA working groups met regularly from March through May, involving national and international NGOs as appropriate and keeping Government counterparts informed of and involved in the process. In recent publications, including the PRSP, the World Bank's Country Assistance Strategy, and several sector- and issue-specific assessments, the key challenges facing Tajikistan have been analyzed repeatedly.

Nonetheless, the dearth of comprehensive, region- and gender-disaggregated data hampers the development of finely tuned strategies. Data presented in the both the MDG and this CCA were gathered from State Statistical Committee, Ministries, UN reports and NGOs and offer as accurate and comprehensive a picture as possible.<sup>5</sup>

This CCA reviews and analyses Tajikistan's development situation in order to answer the question: where can the UN system have the greatest impact in the five years from 2005 to 2009? The analysis attempts to frame the development issues to allow for clear prioritization and a unified approach of the UN Country Team, based on global human rights, conflict prevention and gender-sensitive principles and national needs.

A core concern in all sectors is access to: information, decision making, services and assets. It is the thread that binds together Tajikistan's human, social, political, economic and environmental challenges. To address these challenges, institutional reform, decentralization, capacity building, data collection & analysis and monitoring & evaluation, will need to be strengthened with strong internal and external coordination.

While the UNDAF will define the strategic, goal-driven support of the UN system to Tajikistan's efforts to achieve the MDGs and fulfil its other commitments, this CCA has identified the key challenges, which are in line with the MDGs. Chapters on governance and regional cooperation have been added to present special characteristics of Tajikistan that are not covered in the MDG Report.

The UN Country Team hopes that this CCA will strengthen the collective and individual contributions of the UN system to the development of Tajikistan and to improving the lives of its men, women and children.

---

<sup>5</sup> See Section V. Sources for a complete list.



## **II. Analysis**

### **A. GOVERNANCE**

#### **1. Situation analysis**

Tajikistan is in the process of mastering two complex transitions simultaneously – the move from an authoritarian communist regime to a pluralistic democracy and market economy, and the transition from civil war to a rule-based, inclusive civil order.

Aligning these two processes has been difficult as they follow different logics. While post-conflict stabilization depends on the restoration of the power monopoly of the state and the re-establishment of political and institutional control over dispersed informal powers, this runs counter to liberalization and democratization, which are the substance of a transition from centralized planning to a market economy and from authoritarianism to democracy.

As a result, Tajikistan presents a mixed picture. A number of democratic and market institutions are in place and the legal framework is improving. Yet institutional mandates are not sufficiently clear and the implementation of laws is weak. Decision-making is highly centralized and the opportunities for public participation are limited.

Tajikistan has become increasingly stable over the past five years. Constructive cooperation between the government and opposition leaders has allowed for the re-establishment of security, and in the 18 months preceding mid-2003, no major incidents of political violence occurred. There are no forces inside the country threatening to overthrow the government. The government, however, perceives the activities of underground Islamist groups as a serious threat. In addition, the civil war resulted in a broad change of elites and deprived a number of formerly influential leaders of their stake in the successful development of the country. Many now live outside Tajikistan.

Success in macro-level stabilization is also reflected in improved macroeconomic performance. Inflation was reduced to about 12% in 2002 and the budget deficit to below 1%. Directed credits and quasi-fiscal activities, however, have continued. Policy development improved with the finalization of the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) in 2002 and with first steps toward implementing the Medium-Term Budget Framework. Nonetheless input from state agencies, research institutes, and political parties is weak, and the absence of independent advocacy groups and fora for public opinion impedes progress. Drug inflows from neighbouring Afghanistan contribute to a large shadow economy, which is estimated to be at least of equal size as the official GDP.

To sustain stability, the government urgently needs to broaden access to political, economic and information resources and to essential social services. The scarcity of resources and the high diversity of interests in Tajikistan were among the root causes of the civil war. The fair regulation of competition, broader access to resources, and the creation of level playing fields are vital issues for peace and development in the country.

Decentralization would also benefit capacity building in state institutions. At present, state finances are scarce, amounting to a budget of about US\$ 200 million<sup>6</sup>, which is stretched over four layers of government with 24 line ministries and committees. Decentralization would allow for better linkages of development activities with local authorities.

Democratization and liberalization are gradually proceeding. Six political parties are legally active, three of which are represented in the lower house of Parliament. Open competition and pluralistic debates on public policy, however, remain limited, and local politics, in particular, are dominated by the President's party. Parliament has little public voice in vital debates. Although opposition MPs are represented in Parliament, the assembly tends to present itself as a uniform block. There is little transmission of policy deliberations and voting records are not made available to the public. While some pluralism of media and public opinion exists, it is not deeply rooted and is virtually absent at the local level. Insufficient information from state institutions does not allow for adequate understanding of complex issues by the public and so widens the gap between the people and the state. Despite considerable growth in the number of registered NGOs, civil society organizations in general remain weak and dependent on donor funding. Only a few organizations cover more than one region of the country and there are no stable coalitions lobbying openly on policy issues or engaged in grass-roots advocacy.

---

<sup>6</sup> Law on State Budget of the Republic of Tajikistan for 2003.

In the economic field, many regulations are complicated and obsolete, creating opportunities to extort bribes. Strong vested interests hamper reform, decision-making positions are abused for rent-seeking activities, and nepotism is regarded as a problem. People are subject to various types of formal and non-formal taxation, but see little return in the way of access to resources. Essential social services are declining (see chapters on education and health). Hesitant and non-transparent agricultural reform has thus far failed to provide people with reliable access to land; in addition, local authorities frequently intervene in production and marketing decisions of producers (see chapter on poverty). Overall, the private sector contributed some 30% of officially registered GDP in 2001. Lack of capital and a multitude of bureaucratic hurdles are presently the biggest obstacles to the development of SMEs, which otherwise could become a powerful source of employment.

The increase in security and political stability has not yet resulted in improved human security in the broadest sense, which is threatened by human rights violations, organized crime and gender-based violence, as well as infectious diseases and natural disasters. An unknown number of firearms are still in private hands. Human rights violations occur in all sectors of state and society, and constitutional guarantees are hindered by poverty and inadequate or poorly understood and implemented legislation. Abuses in law enforcement and the frequent and non-transparent use of the death penalty are serious concerns.<sup>7</sup> Complaints of torture have been reported including in death penalty trials, but few perpetrators have been punished. International monitors have not been granted access to prisons. Police operations still bear authoritarian characteristics. An administrative quota system for crime detection, combined with low investigative capacities, lack of adequate respect for citizens' rights and widespread corruption lead to the perception of the police as being a source of, as well as a remedy against, violations of the law. On the other hand, personal safety on the streets of the country's cities and towns is no longer a major issue.

The judicial system is still too weak to be able to guarantee access to justice. The Constitution provides for the independence of the judiciary, but this is not supported by adequate financial resources and is not always respected in daily proceedings. Although the number of court cases has increased (35,000 cases in 2002) due to the lowering of court fees, the ratio of 15,000 criminal to 20,000 civil cases may indicate the need to improve access to and trust in the judiciary. Existing juvenile justice legislation and its implementation are not in line with international standards. Prosecutors supervise judges' rulings and can postpone implementation. Proper boundaries between the judiciary and the executive branch of government and a sincere commitment to the rule of law have yet to be attained.

## **2. What is being done**

In the PRSP, the Government commits to improving macroeconomic management, public administration, policy development and institutional capacities in key sectors. Implementation of the strategy is supported by International Financial Institutions and the UN, which are also assisting sector strategies such as the National Strategic Plan for the Prevention of HIV/AIDS and the National Action Plan on Education.

The Government is also paying increasing attention to strengthening democratic institutions. In 2002, the President met national NGOs for an open debate, new political parties and media are being registered and a working group of members of Parliament and political parties is presently proposing amendments to the electoral code. The UN, the OSCE, and a number of other international organizations support democratic institution building, improving public information, fostering independent media and assisting Parliament's interaction with civil society.

Tajikistan is party to the major human rights conventions, including ICCPR and its first optional protocol, ICESCR, CEDAW, CAT, CRC, and CERD as well as the Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees. In 2002, the Government established a commission on Tajikistan's international obligations in the field of human rights; it coordinates government reports and follows up on recommendations of relevant committees. A separate government commission deals with implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child. The Government adopted a programme for human rights education in 2001, supported by the OSCE, SDC, the UN and other international NGOs and foundations.

Tajikistan is also party to the Ottawa Convention and has requested international assistance to comply with its obligations. It is due to complete the destruction of its anti-personnel mine stockpile by April 2004. The international community responded to the request for assistance and in July 2003, a Mine Action Cell was

---

<sup>7</sup> Human Rights Watch estimates an average of at least five death sentences delivered per month during the first half of 2002. Human Rights Watch World Report 2003: Tajikistan.

opened as part of a UN capacity-building project. The Swiss Foundation for Mine Action initiated a programme to equip and train two survey teams from the Tajik Army Engineer Battalion.

With support from the UN, the Government submitted its first National Report on the Implementation of the Programme of Action to Prevent, Combat and Eradicate the Illicit Trade in Small Arms and Light Weapons. The UN will continue the dialogue with central and local governments about possible support to voluntary small arms collection.

Improvements in the judicial system through the training of judges and advocates are supported by ARD-Checci, the OSCE, the SDC, and the UN. Many organizations are assisting legal reform in specific sectors, but the openness of Parliament to international advice has been limited. The OSCE, SDC and the UN are working with the Ministry of Interior in capacity building and police training. Initial evaluations on inter-governmental relations and initiatives towards local government reform were supported by the OSI, World Bank, the UN and the Urban Institute.

The Government participates in an OECD regional initiative of the Anti-Corruption Network for Transition Economies and has committed to present an initial report on the present status by the end of 2003. The UN leads a working group, with participation from donor community, international organizations and the Government, to facilitate follow up on country level.

### **3. Conclusions**

While stabilization is improving, the government is concerned that liberalization and democratization could endanger stability. Broadened access to political and economic resources is urgently needed for sustaining stability. The development of the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper was informed by a broad participatory process, aimed at giving people a voice in the selection of development priorities. Sustainability of meaningful participation will, however, depend largely on the development of democratic institutions and organizations and by the practice of public consultations on public policy.

Broadening participation by strengthening representative bodies as well as through community mobilization is one of the key challenges for improved governance in Tajikistan. The Government has frequently stated its commitment to democracy and the rule of law. Preparation for the 2005 general elections and the elections themselves will be a serious test of, and decisive for, the people's trust in the Government's commitments. The UN and OSCE can play a major role in ensuring that these elections are well prepared.

The highly centralized government structure and weak separation of powers amongst the executive, legislative and judicial branches of government are serious obstacles to increased transparency and accountability of state institutions. A more decentralized system could improve access to services and to popular participation in the selection of policy priorities. With its broad experience in supporting decentralized development strategies, the UN system can provide much-needed technical support and guidance.

Corruption and rent seeking must be addressed more systematically. Official resource mobilization is low at 15% of GDP,<sup>8</sup> so non-official resource mobilization is common, in the form of informal fees, bribes and corruption. The semi-official practice of mobilizing extra-budget resources by state institutions (such as requiring donations for national celebrations) is a form of additional taxation that tends to crowd out local sponsorship of civic organizations. Through community projects and human rights education, the UN can assist in building capacity and knowledge on the local level to resist extortion. It can also mobilize support for a broad anti-corruption strategy. All international organizations have established strict project implementation and procurement rules and the Government is expected to complete a status report by the end of 2003.

A professional police force and democratic control over security services are of vital importance to protect people from harassment, arbitrary prosecution and for winning popular trust in law and order. The performance of all law enforcement bodies must be improved. The UN can contribute to this through its Civilian Police department and long experience in democratic governance.

The low national capacity to collect, manage and analyze data is another critical development challenge. Although Tajikistan is moving closer to adopting some international norms, such as international accounting practices, many international standards are not yet adhered to, which tends to obscure vulnerabilities and development needs.

---

<sup>8</sup> Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, Dushanbe June 2002.

## **B. POVERTY**

### **1. Situation analysis**

The many factors contributing to poverty in Tajikistan have been discussed in the PRSP and the MDG Report. Limited budget resources at the national level and stalled implementation of social sector reform have exacerbated the vulnerability of the majority of the population. Coping mechanisms are overstretched and have included limiting the number of meals per day, selling off personal goods and reliance on money transfers from relatives working abroad. One aspect of the feminization of poverty has been the large number of female-headed households, a consequence of the civil war and labour migration. The Government has thus far been unable to formulate and implement a targeted and transparent re-distributive system to address these growing inequalities and increasing marginalization.

The poor tend to have more children as family planning is limited by a lack of information and resources. The Government has recognized that the current population dynamics are not conducive to the country's economic development and poverty reduction goals. Trends indicate that over the next decade, the birth rate (and thus the population growth rate) will continue to be high. An increasingly young population and declining school attendance could result in a large and unskilled segment of the population, with few employment opportunities.

Three quarters of the population live in the countryside, which increases pressure on scarce resources. Inadequate land reform has led to the unequal distribution of land, with much of it still retained by state farms. Lacking the right to cultivate the land as they choose and with a system of forced cotton production and marketing, many farmers are plunged deeper into debt as they receive no share of the profits. With no private ownership of land, production has all but stagnated. Plots made available for household use are extremely small and can only be passed on through inheritance, most often only to men. Most land must be irrigated and since the irrigation infrastructure has severely deteriorated, much of the production now depends on scarce and unpredictable rainfall. Irrigated fields are reserved almost exclusively for cotton, while cereal production is reliant on rainfall. Food security is thus seriously affected by droughts. As food insecurity rises, vulnerability to disease and malnutrition increases. For the rural economy to grow, further immediate reforms are needed in land ownership and decentralization. State interference in farmers' decision-making on what to grow needs to be reduced and support systems to secure access to agricultural inputs should be set up. Farmers need access to loans to improve their productivity and diversify their crops and access to markets in neighbouring countries must be facilitated, as the domestic markets are small.

With the break-up of the Soviet Union, Tajikistan lost its main trading partners and access to established markets. The weak banking system has been unable to provide credit, which has hampered progress not only in agriculture, but also in the emergence of free enterprise. Entrepreneurs and farmers lack market information (for example, on prices and demand), not least due to the weak telecommunications network and poorly developed media. Although it has vast hydroelectric potential (the second largest water resources in the CIS), Tajikistan is unable to meet its own energy needs, which hinders the provision of social services and economic growth. Such growth is therefore conditioned upon agreements with neighbouring countries (See Chapter H on regional cooperation).

Improved access to irrigation and potable water cuts across all MDGs and plays an important role in poverty alleviation. As an agricultural input, irrigation water increases crop yields, thereby reducing hunger. Easier access will reduce water-fetching duties, often the responsibility of young girls. Considered a basic human right, better water quality will improve health, permit children to attend school more regularly and reduce child and maternal mortality.

Poverty in Tajikistan means that the vast majority of the rural population has low incomes and inadequate access to improved agricultural inputs. A vicious cycle of poverty has emerged, with the majority of the population turning to subsistence farming on small patches of land to meet immediate food needs. Those without access to land depend on external aid. While the continuing need for immediate assistance is acknowledged, external aid must now lay the basis for the transition from relief to development.

### **2. What is being done**

The PRSP provides an analysis of the root causes of poverty in the country and the means with which to alleviate it. Implementation of the PRSP requires prioritization of immediate needs and long-term strategies. Greater government-led coordination of external assistance is needed to support the implementation of the PRSP. This means that the ministries and units responsible for directing and overseeing assistance must

coordinate their activities to present a common approach and to improve the flow of information between the local and central government.

The UN is ideally situated to assist the government in implementing the PRSP through its ability to identify and prioritize interventions that will achieve the greatest developmental impact. The UN can analyze and monitor implementation against the MDGs to maximize the benefits of poverty alleviation efforts across the country.

The MDG Report builds on the PRSP and is a progressive step in establishing benchmarks and priorities that are clear and tangible for poverty reduction. The next step for the Government, with support from the UNCT, is a proper costing of the MDGs to make its commitments concrete.

According to the PRSP, the Government intends to increase expenditures on healthcare, education, pensions and a revised system of cash compensation, but a lack of reliable data hinders its ability to efficiently allocate scarce resources to ensure that the most vulnerable segments of society are targeted. This points to the inefficiencies of what is still an over-centralized national administration.

With regard to land reform, government initiatives have been inadequate. Since independence, some reform and redistribution measures have been implemented. For example, household plots have been allocated and are utilized intensively for self-sufficiency and income generation. Land rental and hiring arrangements have been introduced. (Large lease farms are unlikely to benefit households as they continue to employ individuals for negligible wages.) These reforms indicate that the household level has received relatively few of the benefits of land reform.

The leasing of small parcels of land, however, has had some impact on household economies. In 1999, in response to IMF lending conditionality, nearly all State and collective farms were transformed into *dehkhans* (small family farms or larger collective farms), based on lifelong inheritable leases. State control over the crops produced and the continuing debt of many farmers demonstrate the need for further reform.

The Ministry of Labour and Social Protection is responsible for nationwide unemployment centres, vocational training, and labour migration; however, it does not possess adequately trained staff and resources. To provide greater focus to the Ministry's activities, a comprehensive labour market survey is needed. Labour market needs of the main destination countries for Tajik migrants should be taken into account.

The UN currently supports vocational training for vulnerable groups. These efforts require greater coordination and stronger links to government policy.

Micro-credit schemes can improve employment-generation opportunities, but organizations involved in this area need to avoid overlap and develop a common approach. Additionally, activities of the UN have to be reviewed against the forthcoming law on micro-finance institutions.

As recognized by the Government, Water User Associations (WUAs) have an important role to play in sustainable water management. A monthly coordination meeting amongst organizations working in this sector (AAH, ACTED, ADB, ECHO, USAID and several UN Agencies) is sharing information, examining lessons learned and discussing common difficulties. These agencies are promoting the development of more WUAs.

### **3. Conclusions**

Farmers need a) access to loans to improve their productivity and diversify their crops, b) the autonomy to decide what to cultivate and c) access to reliable information, so important in a market economy. The Government needs to facilitate access to markets in neighbouring countries given the limited scope of domestic markets and support systems should be established to secure access to agricultural inputs. Access to decision-making authorities can be directly addressed through decentralization.

The UN has a comparative advantage in implementing multi-sectoral projects to support the rural economy through expertise, agricultural input and improved access to information.

Decentralization would benefit both local authorities and the national government. Given the scarcity of resources at the central level, decentralization would free the central authorities from micro-managing policies and strengthen initiatives and empowerment at the local level. Local level initiatives, through identification and prioritization of problems and their solutions, coupled with implementation and

monitoring, can result in more specific, focused and targeted interventions. Practical approaches such as WUAs should be actively encouraged.

As addressed in the Governance chapter, the UN can advise on overall local governance strategy formulated at the central level by drawing on its knowledge and experience with local level initiatives. The UN can act as a facilitator of dialogue amongst civil society, local governments and the central government.

If the benefits of decentralization are to pay off, capacity building is mandatory. For projects to be sustainable, capacity building for local authorities must be a primary component of any project design. This must be done in tandem with awareness raising amongst local populations.

The economy cannot grow without skilled labour retained domestically and administration cannot become efficient without qualified, motivated staff and sound leadership. Given the expected support from donors through the CG process for the implementation of the PRSP, capacity building amongst the agencies responsible for coordination of external aid must be undertaken to ensure adequate absorption capacity of available funding.

Reform in the social sector is crucial to ensure targeting of the most vulnerable segments of society. Land reform has not been expansive enough for many households to move beyond currently unsustainable subsistence farming. Registration procedures must be simplified and made less expensive and control of crop production on *dehkhan* farms must be addressed if farmers are to climb out of debt and begin to react to market signals of price and demand. All reform efforts should seek to maximize accountability and transparency at the national and local levels for long-term development. With its broad multi-sectoral expertise, presence at local level and rights-based approach, the UN can assist the government in targeting the most vulnerable groups and formulating appropriate reform strategies.

Data collection and analysis is a key challenge as comprehensive and reliable data is largely absent in almost all sectors in the country. Capacity for data analysis in the State Statistical Committee is limited; an overall data collection and management system must be developed for wider policy decisions to be taken.

The World Bank is working on a new poverty assessment; the previous assessment, published in 2000, has been the main source of poverty data for the past three years. This new assessment should provide data that will make it possible for the first time in Tajikistan to establish and analyze evolving trends.

## C. PEOPLE IN NEED OF SPECIAL PROTECTION

### 1. Situation analysis

The people of Tajikistan have a right to social protection as embodied in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and other international conventions that Tajikistan has ratified. Unfortunately, the government has not been able since independence to deliver the entitlements its people deserve – especially for the extremely vulnerable groups when they most needed support – nor created opportunities for communities and families to participate in decisions that affect their lives.

With the vast majority of Tajikistan's population living below the poverty line,<sup>9</sup> an argument can be made that this majority is at risk. Nonetheless, some groups are especially vulnerable and in need of special social protection measures. These groups should be targeted for special assistance as they can easily become socially segregated and marginalized. Unfortunately, scarcity of government funds has led to serious under-financing of social welfare and protection services, and the decline in family and community capacity has exacerbated the situation, resulting in reliance on external aid. The number of those who depend on social assistance continues to increase.

Some of the currently identified groups in need of special protection include institutionalized children and adults; female-headed households; the elderly; food-insecure households; relocated individuals and families; people with disabilities; street children and working children; youth; and women and children who are abused.

Between 1997 and 2002, the number of children in institutions increased by 32%. The majority of children in these institutions have either one or both biological parents, but their families are financially unable to care for them. More than 34,000 individuals under the age of 34 are registered as mentally or physically disabled. The actual number of people with disabilities may be higher, as in the past many families did not register family members because of the social stigma associated with disability. Three fourths of children with disabilities remain outside of school, thus deprived of both education and social interaction. Individuals over 65 have a higher probability of being poor than younger people, with even greater vulnerability amongst people over 75 years old. Members of female-headed households are also especially vulnerable in the worsening socio-economic situation, with many women and their children having to spend much of their time on survival activities or working for meagre financial return.

Management responsibility for social institutions is currently fragmented, and financial flows are unclear. State-run institutions fall under five Ministries: Health, Labour and Social Protection, Education, Justice, and Interior,<sup>10</sup> with many also run by the government at oblast and rayon levels.

Refugees and returnees require continued attention until durable solutions are found, that is, until repatriation potentials are fully pursued, local integration is explored and resettlement opportunities found. Poverty, lack of proper documentation and limited employment possibilities made it difficult for returnees to rebuild their lives in Tajikistan despite reintegration assistance from the UN and NGOs.

Youth between the ages of 15 and 25 comprise 20% of the population and are often marginalized due to the pressures of poverty, unemployment, drugs and violence. With a trend towards early marriage and incomplete knowledge about family planning, STIs and HIV-AIDS, this age group risks marginalization and becoming part of a surge in STIs and HIV infection.

The increase in especially vulnerable people in recent years is compounded by a decline in the Government's capacity to provide adequate protection.<sup>11</sup> There has been no reform of social protection systems and financial constraints are exacerbated by ineffective targeting of beneficiaries of social welfare services. Institutionalization is the primary means of social protection, but is generally more costly than community-based care schemes. It reinforces social segregation and the stigma associated with people at social risk. Public awareness of human rights is low. As noted in the Poverty section, traditional coping mechanisms in communities and extended families have been exhausted during more than a decade of great duress.

---

<sup>9</sup> TLSS 1999.

<sup>10</sup> The MLSP and MOE both maintain institutions for children with disabilities.

<sup>11</sup> PRSP, p11 and p17.

## **2. What is being done**

Government, NGOs and UN agencies are addressing the problems of these particularly vulnerable groups and communities in several ways. The UN and international and local NGOs provided reintegration assistance to returnees and are involved in dozens of micro-credit or income-generating projects that increase household income and help build self-esteem. With the support of the UN, the Government is conducting a situation analysis aiming at developing a national policy for people with disabilities and children deprived of familial care. The Commission on Minors' Affairs was re-constituted and its mandate expanded to include the protection of children in conflict with the law or otherwise at risk. The Parliament recently approved legislation on education services for children with disabilities. More systematic social welfare reform is now starting with the support of the EU and UN.

Some projects are targeted at helping communities rebuild their livelihoods, but capacity building of communities and families to care for their most vulnerable members is still limited. On the government side, comprehensive measures for social protection reform have yet to be undertaken. Until recently, donor interest in reform of the social protection scheme was limited. While a large number of vulnerable people still depend on humanitarian assistance to sustain themselves, international assistance could do more to improve social welfare services which protect the rights of people most in need of protection, including the development of better targeting mechanisms.

The UN system has a unique opportunity to address the challenges of marginalized groups with its strong expertise in rights-based programming, promotion of non-discrimination and social inclusion, and long experience in working at community and family levels to strengthen civil society.

## **3. Conclusions**

A two-pronged approach to fulfil the rights of vulnerable populations could be considered. On the one hand, the Government must be supported to undertake social protection reform that will adequately protect people at social risk in compliance with international human rights treaties and standards. On the other hand, communities and families should be provided with the chance to increase their skills and knowledge in making decisions and with opportunities to take actions that can improve their own vulnerable situation or that of particularly vulnerable family or community members.

For example, de-institutionalization has to be progressively incorporated into state social protection policy as part of social protection reform. Social support services will benefit from de-institutionalization as non-institutional care costs less, and more attention can be paid to strengthening family-based care and strengthening community capacities. The integration of people at risk encourages empowerment and skills development of the vulnerable population; this will lead to a genuine improvement in human rights, thus contributing to democratic and non-discriminatory development. Reform and attitude changes are long-term processes. They require a multi-faceted approach that includes restructuring social welfare expenditure, more emphasis on family and youth support services, developing the skills of social workers, and promoting community-based alternatives.

Social protection reform needs to address the issue of access to social services for people in need of special protection. People with disabilities, elderly people and returnees are most at risk of being deprived of their access to education, appropriate medical and rehabilitation care, and important information. The accommodating capacity and quality of care at institutions is limited, so reform measures are required in both policy and service delivery. The reform process has to promote access to equal opportunities to enable people in need of special protection to develop their social and life skills, to find employment opportunities, and to participate actively in civil society.

Public expenditure in social welfare services should be restructured for more cost-effective service provision and accountability for services needs to be decentralized and streamlined. Enhanced capacity at local government level is vital to help ensure family-oriented care and out-reach services. This means social work and participatory, community-based activities need to be recognised and supported as an alternative to government-based responses. Social work services such as home visiting care, psychosocial counselling, day care and legal advice are effective means to maximize the life skills of people in need of special care. Families with disabled or elderly members should be educated on the care and development of these vulnerable family members. The establishment of professional social work expertise is equally critical for government, communities and families.



Competent management and policy development require a functioning information system on social protection. Such a system would compile information on the people eligible for special protection and their needs so that services can be better targeted. The data need to be updated regularly on the local level and can then be fed into a database at the national level. Such an information system would facilitate social protection reform and would improve the monitoring of service quality and the situation of people in need of special protection measures.

## D. EDUCATION

### 1. Situation analysis

Access to quality education in Tajikistan is declining drastically. The challenges include constraints in state and local budgets, weak management, dilapidated physical infrastructure, inefficient allocation of teachers and low teacher salaries, inadequate training of teachers, outdated and irrelevant curricula, family poverty and under-nourishment and a lack of parental and community participation. By 2015, the already over-stretched education sector will need to accommodate an increase in the school-age population of an estimated 50%.<sup>12</sup> Indeed, Tajikistan is facing the possibility that literacy and education levels may decline before they improve.

Enrolment at all levels from the pre-school to secondary school levels has been decreasing. Dropout and non-attendance are on the rise in upper primary grades, which is mainly attributed to family poverty. Indeed, some children work on the streets, in markets, or the cotton fields to supplement their families' incomes.<sup>13</sup> Parents are often unable to provide their children with learning materials, sufficient study time and an adequate learning environment, or even adequate food. Malnourished children are frequently absent from school and may suffer delays in cognitive development. Vitamin A, iron and iodine deficiencies adversely affect their ability to attend school and to learn (see Chapter [F] on health).<sup>14</sup>

The gender disparity in school attendance and dropout rates have been growing at the primary, secondary and higher education levels. Girls are at a higher risk than boys of not attending school regularly and of dropping out before completing nine years of compulsory education. The gender disparity widens at the secondary and higher education levels. Major reasons for girls' non-attendance are poverty and low prestige of education amongst parents. Also, few parents have an adequate understanding of gender equality and the best interests of the child; re-emerging traditional gender roles in families and communities regard secondary and higher education as less important for girls.<sup>15</sup>

Enrolment has also decreased at the pre-school level, as the decline in social infrastructure, social services and generally low knowledge on early childhood development has particularly affected the conditions for younger children. Surveyed parents showed little understanding of the young child's development and learning needs, appropriate nutrition, and the prevention and management of illnesses.<sup>16</sup>

The quality of education has declined during the 1990s; and while some recovery of social service delivery is in progress, the capacity of government to fulfil its responsibilities to maintain and upgrade education services is limited by fiscal constraints, weak human resources and outdated curricula. Private education in Tajikistan is a recent phenomenon and is not widespread. Attention must be paid that a gap between families with resources to send their children to private schools and those who have no resources is not created that will later be difficult to surmount.

The teaching profession has suffered greatly. From the early 1990s onward, some 4,000 qualified teachers and school managers emigrated or left the profession. Some 20% of teachers do not have any formal training and only 62% have university-level education.<sup>17</sup> Once teachers enter the profession, few in-service opportunities are available to them to enhance their teaching skills.<sup>18</sup> Contributing factors to the teacher shortage are the low prestige of the teaching profession and teachers' minimal salaries, which despite an increase in 2002, stand at only US\$ 7 a month.

Nearly 20% of the country's schools were destroyed during the civil war, and 80% of the remaining schools are in need of major repair, as they often lack heating, clean drinking water, adequate sewage systems and electricity.<sup>19</sup> The number of higher education institutions, on the other hand, has grown from 10 to 35 since independence. While in theory this sounds positive, it is not known whether the new, mostly public, institutions are filling a gap that other universities do not meet, or is a symptom of fragmentation in higher education.

---

<sup>12</sup> Tajikistan Education Sector Review (forthcoming), World Bank, October 2002, pp 6-7.

<sup>13</sup> UNICEF/UNESCO Monitoring Learning Achievement (MLA) Study, 2002.

<sup>14</sup> Vitamin A Study in Khatlon, Ministry of Health and Kazakhstan Academy of Nutrition, 2002.

<sup>15</sup> Association of Women with University Education, 2002.

<sup>16</sup> Children and Family Needs Assessment, UNICEF, 2001.

<sup>17</sup> Tajikistan Education Sector Review, p. 35.

<sup>18</sup> UNICEF MTR Paper 2002 and H. Boboev (First Deputy Minister of Education) presentation, 1 March 2003.

<sup>19</sup> UNICEF MTR Paper 2002 and S. Safarov (Min. of Finance) presentation, 1 March 2003.

Although some changes have been made, national curricula have not been thoroughly updated for several years at any educational level. The current curricula are hierarchical, information-centred and repetitious, rather than focused on developing higher-level thinking skills, independent judgement, self-reliance, citizenship and marketable skills. Some elements of human rights and civic education as well as information on STIs, HIV-AIDS and hygiene promotion have been introduced.

A shortage of teaching materials from textbooks and blackboards to manuals and laboratory supplies plagues the entire system. Prior to 1996, basic education textbooks were free of charge, but since then students have had to pay for them, leaving only one in ten students with a full set of textbooks. The situation is further complicated by the requirement of education in the mother tongue up to grade 11. Textbooks in Tajik, Russian, Uzbek, Kyrgyz and Turkmen should be available but are not. In fact, textbooks from neighbouring countries are reportedly used, which do not meet Tajikistan's cultural and educational needs. The only exception is for Kyrgyz students, who benefit from an intergovernmental agreement and whose teachers are trained in Kyrgyzstan.<sup>20</sup>

Higher education faces the same quality constraints as basic and secondary education but unfortunately must deal with an additional challenge, that of bribery of teachers for the enrolment of students and passing of university exams. This seems to be a two-way issue (with active involvement by both professors and students) that is acknowledged by the Ministry of Education as unacceptable.<sup>21</sup>

Technical/vocational education has also suffered the consequences of limited funding and is particularly affected due to the high costs of equipment and materials. As most training programmes were established before independence, they do not sufficiently accommodate current needs. Nonetheless, the Government acknowledges that this type of education will play a major role in the country's socio-economic development.

Informal education through out-of-school institutions and educational NGOs can promote personal and professional development, as well as healthy lifestyles. In Tajikistan, however, this sector is not well developed in either urban or rural areas. A need exists for reliable information and data on non-formal education.

## **2. What is being done**

Greater commitment by the Government and increased donor interest are energizing the country's flagging education system. Concept papers, plans of action and legislation have been developed to establish the framework, target and budget required to reform the education system. These include the 1993 Law on Education, the National Education Sector Development Plan (NESDP) for 2003-2010, the National Report on Education for All for the Year 2000, the National Concept of Education in the Republic of Tajikistan for 2002 and the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, which includes 43 specific recommendations for the education sector.

However, the budget for education remains unacceptably low at only 2.6% of GDP.<sup>22</sup> The Government recognizes that between 4% and 6% of GDP is normally allocated to education in countries with a comparable financial situation. The PRSP foresees an increase by 0.2 percentage point of GDP annually over a three-year period. Salaries and related benefits, as low as they are, consume 80% of government spending in the sector, so the PRSP's projected salary increase would most likely consume a large portion of any increase in available funds. About 83% of education spending is covered by the local *hukumats*, who are responsible for pre-school, basic and secondary education.<sup>23</sup>

The government encourages community involvement and many donors are introducing community-based activities, but the participation of children, parents and the community in school management is nonetheless limited, with only 19% of schools in one survey having PTAs.<sup>24</sup> In a number of pilot schemes, UN agencies and NGOs are supporting, in the form of school grants, community-based Education Management Information Systems, PTAs, and other community-based activities. However, much more needs to be done to build capacity of local communities and schools in data collection, analysis and use.

---

<sup>20</sup> UNICEF, *The Right to Quality Education*, 2002.

<sup>21</sup> S. Safarov speech, op cit.

<sup>22</sup> MDG Report (based on data from MOE). The World Bank estimates 2% of GDP on education.

<sup>23</sup> Safarov and Sanginov speeches at 2nd Donor Coordination Meeting.

<sup>24</sup> PRSP and Report from the Education Donor Coordination Meeting, September 2002, UNICEF/UNESCO MLA Study, 2002.

Investments from the international community are critical for the Government's education plans and proposed activities including teacher training, school rehabilitation, curriculum reform and textbook development. Girls' education is being addressed through "Education for All" and global education initiatives. As one of the few organizations to work in this remote region, the Aga Khan Foundation provides teacher training, health education and other support in Gorno-Badakhshan.

Over the past two years, development assistance pledged for education reform in Tajikistan has increased. The UN, the IFIs and a number of bilateral donor agencies<sup>25</sup> meet for regular discussions in order to coordinate assistance in the education sector with the Ministry of Education.

The UN system promotes a holistic perspective, working to ensure that a rights-based approach is integrated in all programmes. The UN has put forward the child-friendly school initiative, and contributes to the development of a National Plan of Action on Education for All, aiming to guarantee full access to compulsory education, reduce gender disparity, ensure inclusive education and participation, and improve quality teaching and learning.

### **3. Conclusions**

Education reform is underway with the commitment of the Government as outlined in the PRSP and the National Education Sector Development Plan (NESDP) for 2003-2010. However, to achieve the EFA, MDG and NPA targets by 2015, greater efforts need to be made. The reforms require support at all levels. It is critically important that policy analysis and development are further strengthened, so that national plans focus on improving access and the quality of education. The reforms also need to address curriculum development, teacher training, textbooks, and the improvement of learning conditions and materials. Financial requirements for the reform process have to be analyzed and realistically budgeted, perhaps in a phased longer-term plan that could encourage further government commitment in both policy and expenditures.

Declining access in education is the most alarming problem, not least due to the implications for the literacy rate. A root cause is that duty bearers at all levels – the state, community and the family as the primary caregiver – are not able to meet their obligations to ensure children's access to quality education and development opportunities. The weakened capacity of duty bearers is evident in major challenges facing the education system across all age groups and grade levels. While the education reform process addresses national policy and technical development by restructuring public expenditure in the education sector, targeted support is also needed for impoverished families to enable them to send their children to school.

Reform at the national level has to be enhanced by decentralization, clarifying the accountability of local governments in the provision of education services, and promoting resource mobilization and decision-making by communities and parents in school management. In the MDG Report, the Government acknowledges the need to encourage participatory governance of schools. Community members and parents are encouraged to participate through Parent-Teacher Associations and parent committees. Recent legislation allows schools to engage in fund-raising activities to help improve the school environment. Local authorities and parents can assume some financial and administrative responsibilities. Also, students themselves, even young pupils, can participate in decisions that affect them and their school environment, including, for example, promotion of better hygiene practices. With support from the international community, communities' capacity to monitor school attendance and the quality of learning can also be strengthened.

Such a decentralization of decision making, financing and management must be accompanied by capacity building, including management skills. Both the pre-service and in-service training of teachers needs to be reformed, with new curricula and new teaching methodologies to upgrade the professional skills of teachers.

To meet these many challenges, a strengthening of management and information systems in education is indispensable. The lack of accurate and gender-disaggregated data is an obstacle in monitoring school attendance and learning achievements and in identifying children at risk of exclusion, particularly girls. This complicates strategic planning for future interventions. A national database for an Education Management Information System has to be established to assist the Ministry of Education to develop analytical and management skills to monitor and evaluate steps taken in education sector reform.

---

<sup>25</sup> Ministry of Education, Ministry of Finance, ADB, Aga Khan Foundation, CARE International, DIFD, GTZ, SCF-UK, Soros Foundation, UNESCO, UNICEF, USAID, World Bank, and others as interested.

## E. GENDER

### 1. Situation analysis

Gender roles in Tajik society are influenced by the recent Soviet experience, with its strong emphasis on gender equality in the public sphere, and Tajik tradition, in which women played a central role in the private, family sphere. Although Tajikistan remains a secular state, there has been a revival of some Islamic practices, sometimes interpreted in ways not in keeping with more progressive interpretations of Islamic teachings and often detrimental to the situation of women in the country. During the difficult transition period, many state benefits have been discontinued, e.g., child allowances and child-care facilities. Also, while some important public leadership roles are held by women and some women have a university education, their overall proportion in Government and management positions remains low.

Gender discrimination starts at home, where many women do not have equal rights with men. They are seen as service-providers to their husbands, children and in-laws and at the same time are expected to bring in money. Household decision making tends to favour boys over girls. Girls are at greater risk than boys in not attending school regularly and in dropping out before completing nine years of compulsory education. This is due to some parents' belief that education is more important for boys than it is for girls. Girls are also often considered as temporary members of their own family; once married, a woman is expected to be at the service of her in-laws and to obey them. Their status may be raised only through childbearing, with a strong preference for sons. A WHO study showed that women prefer to bear sons, as they believe their daughters suffer more in their adult life.<sup>26</sup>

Girls and women are likely to experience physical and other forms of violence. Many are forced to work in the fields especially during the cotton season, are prevented by their parents from continuing their education, and are forced into early marriage.<sup>27</sup> More than a third of interviewed women reported experiencing physical violence, and more than half reported experiencing psychological violence.<sup>28</sup> Parents-in-law often verbally abuse or threaten their daughters-in-law and husbands control their wives' reproductive health decisions. The low social status of young women sometimes leads them to resort to violence against themselves, including suicide by self-immolation. On average, 30 women a month are admitted to hospital with severe burns. Suicides of young, recently married women seem to be increasing; this phenomenon needs immediate study. Lack of access to social services and to information about their rights, compounded by traditional practices that accept physical and psychological violence, make the issue of domestic violence difficult to address. The attitude of most lawyers and judges to domestic violence against women and children is that it is a private matter.

Polygamy, though still illegal, has come to be regarded as an acceptable coping strategy to deal with the increase in the number of young childless widows that resulted from the civil war. In actual practice, divorce is verbal and may be initiated only by the husband or his mother. Ex-husbands are not obliged to support their children or ex-wives in case of divorce, leaving an unknown number of women to fend for themselves and their children.

In the economic sphere, women face high and increasing pressures given the unequal workload distribution between themselves and their spouses and their lack of access to childcare and other services. "Time poverty" is an inevitable consequence: women spend almost twice as much as time on unpaid work as men (6.3 hours versus 3.3 hours a day) with an even higher among rural women (7 hours for women versus 5.8 hours a day for men). Women provide most of the labour on farms, but have virtually no access to land rights. In addition, women in both rural and urban areas rely on the large informal economy, which complicates their access to social security benefits and to capital. Another factor that limits women's ability to engage in business initiatives is their lack of adequate entrepreneurial skills.

Trafficking of women and children, mainly for sexual exploitation and domestic labour, is a growing problem that needs further analysis. One of the most important factors rendering many women particularly vulnerable is their cultural isolation from the outside world, and their perceived role in society tending to restrict them to being housewives and child bearers. Some women therefore leave their homes and become

---

<sup>26</sup> WHO, 2000.

<sup>27</sup> WHO/SDC/WID/Open Asia, 2000; 'Association of Young Leaders' study, 2001; 'Open Asia' study 2001; 'Tradition and Modernity' Study on Polygamy 2002; CARE Project to reduce Violence Against Women in Bokhtar, Vakhsh and Yavan.

<sup>28</sup> "Violence against women," WHO 2000.

easy targets for traffickers.<sup>29</sup> Human trafficking is also linked to the high level of illicit drugs passing through Tajikistan and to increased involvement of women as drug couriers. Lack of awareness of trafficking issues, and weak law enforcement in Tajikistan and destination countries, provide fertile ground for the expansion of trafficking networks.

In the political arena, participation of women has dropped significantly since independence, especially in higher government structures. While the system of reserved quotas at all levels of government has ensured some representation of women, it has not proven to be fully effective. A 1999 Presidential Decree called for women to be appointed to the positions of deputy ministers and regional governors, but women are still poorly represented at these and more senior levels. Women do not hold key positions in any of the political parties and none of the older political parties has a gender policy to promote women's participation. Only the recently registered Social Democratic Party has declared that it will pursue gender balance in its bodies and in its nomination of candidates for elections. In the 2000 elections, eight women were elected and they currently hold 16% of the seats in Parliament. Women constitute 21% of officials in the executive and judiciary branches of the Government.

Improved overall conditions for the development of civil society in Tajikistan have contributed to the increased participation of women in civil society. There are currently 128 registered women's NGOs,<sup>30</sup> including an association of businesswomen and an association of women university graduates. Involvement of women in these NGOs has helped expand the development of civil society at the national, regional and district levels.

## **2. What is being done**

Policies and legislation are in place to enable the Government of Tajikistan to improve the situation and status of women in the country. The "National Plan of Action to Improve the Situation of Women for 1998-2005" and the 2001 "Main Directions of State Policies for Ensuring Equal Rights and Opportunities for Men and Women in Tajikistan for 2001-2010" are two instruments for achieving gender equity. The Committee on Women and Family Issues is the government institution entrusted with women's rights at national and hukumat level. However, budget resources for the implementation of the plan are limited and ministerial structures have not been established.

The Constitution provides for full equality of men and women and Tajikistan has been party to the CEDAW since 1993. Some but not all legislation reflects the Constitutional commitment to equal rights through laws on family relations, labour rights, and crime. There is less on land tenure. Implementation and enforcement of existing laws are weak, due to the overall weakness of legal and judicial institutions. Not least, the concept of discrimination is poorly defined. Furthermore, women have insufficient access to the few existing structures where they could make claims. The draft of a forthcoming Gender Equality Law is currently being discussed by women's NGOs and the Government Committee on Women and Family Issues to ensure that it includes statutory guarantees for equality. Such a process of gender sensitivity consultation, including civil society in the discussions and debates should become the rule for all draft legislation. The Government decree on girls' access to higher education is another document that could help advance women's rights.

The growth in women's NGOs is encouraging, including some on violence against women. Many of the national women's NGOs are small and need further support. International NGOs, while often focusing on women as target populations for project activities, sometimes do not introduce specific gender perspectives that would contribute to information and knowledge at all levels of society.

## **3. Conclusions**

There are growing signs that the gender gap could be narrowed through Government policies, with the participation of civil society and the support of the UN system. The UN system must support a framework which makes the link between poverty at the micro level and macroeconomic policy-making; and, which enables institutional, legal and judicial reform with special provisions for gender equality. In addition, a stronger emphasis needs to be placed on working with families and communities where much of the discrimination begins and is perpetuated. Educating parents on the importance of education for girls should be a priority.

---

<sup>29</sup> IOM 2001, "A study of trafficking in Women and children."

<sup>30</sup> Gender and Development directory, 2001.

Women have limited access to information, education, and employment opportunities compared to men. Ensuring equal opportunities for both has been laid down in the law, but a comprehensive implementation strategy is needed to address existing discriminatory social values and practices.

Gender sensitivity and equality should be widely promoted at community level through education and life-skills development for girls and women, which will enhance their social interaction and participation as full citizens. Local governments should enhance such opportunities through social service provision. This can be complemented with consistent public awareness-raising efforts in which civil society organizations can take a progressive role. Assistance from the UN and other international organizations should be examined for gender sensitivity so as to help build the knowledge and capacity of national and local governments and of civil society organizations in promoting gender equality.

A pressing need exists for reliable and easily accessible gender statistics. Two critical areas not usually addressed are resource allocation and time use within the household. In Tajikistan, where gender inequality is experienced as much within the household as in society as a whole, this is an important omission. Reporting mechanisms stipulated by international conventions to which Tajikistan is a party can serve as a starting point for data collection and analysis.

## F. HEALTH

### 1. Situation analysis

Tajikistan used to rank with middle upper-income countries in terms of the major health indicators. Today, morbidity and mortality rates are alarmingly high. The high infant, under-5 and maternal mortality rates and the increasing prevalence of malaria, tuberculosis, measles and other diseases are the result of decreased access to and the overall poor quality of health services. The civil war and its immediate aftermath devastated the state healthcare infrastructure and created a dependency on international humanitarian assistance.

Major causes of infant and child deaths are infectious diseases, acute respiratory infections, diarrhoeal diseases and malnutrition, compounded by poor management of illness at family level. These are linked to inadequate peri-natal care, contributing to low birth weight and congenital abnormality. The infant mortality rate (IMR) may also be influenced by low birth and death registration. Only 45% of children under six months of age are officially registered, denying children their right to an identity and limiting their access to education and other services.

Nationally, the officially stated Maternal Mortality Rate has decreased to 50.6 in 2002.<sup>31</sup> However, based on the figures from some assessments,<sup>32</sup> there is general agreement that maternal mortality is higher. Haemorrhage is the leading cause of maternal death, followed by eclampsia. The high proportion of deaths due to bleeding can be attributed at least in part to the high anaemia rate, which increases the risk of death by five times. The physical conditions in maternity hospitals are poor, with sporadic water and energy supplies and a lack of essential drugs and consumable equipment.<sup>33</sup>

High prevalence of micronutrient deficiency disorders also indirectly contributes to high infant and maternal mortality. Deficiencies in three major micronutrients – iron, iodine and Vitamin A – are recognized as a public health concern, but little has been done to address them. More needs to be known about the level of iodine deficiency, which causes low energy levels, poor performance at school and at work and causes goitre and other health problems. Micronutrient deficiency, household food insecurity and improper feeding practices and dietary behaviour contribute to malnutrition in both children and adults, particularly women. The malnutrition situation amongst under-5s has not significantly changed over the last two years, and remains of particular concern in Khatlon. An NGO study shows nearly 10% of children under five suffer from acute malnutrition and one-third suffer from chronic malnutrition – often due to diarrhoea.<sup>34</sup> Breastfeeding practice remains low. Only 19% of mothers are breastfeeding at four months, while international norms call for six months.<sup>35</sup> Weaning at too early an age and low nutritional value in weaning foods also contribute to child malnutrition.<sup>36</sup>

Tajikistan had high immunization coverage in the Soviet period, but immunization services suffered substantial disruptions in the 1990s due to financial constraints and the political instability. Outbreaks of vaccine-preventable diseases, particularly measles, have again become a major cause of child morbidity in Tajikistan. Measles epidemics are occurring in a three-year cycle, due most likely to the accumulation of children who have not been immunized. Although official data indicate high EPI<sup>37</sup> coverage for all traditional vaccines, MICS 2000 shows that only 56% of children received all recommended doses of vaccine by their first birthday. A second dose of measles vaccine at six years of age was introduced into the EPI in 2001, but coverage remains low because of lack of awareness among both health workers and parents. Additionally, continuing problems in cold chain maintenance and difficult access to remote health facilities and rural populations negatively impact on vaccination safety. Nonetheless, vigorous efforts in the 1990s resulted in Tajikistan being certified by WHO as polio-free in June 2002.

The Government's MDG Report notes that the target of halting and reversing the spread of malaria by 2015 is unlikely to be met without significant investment and attention. Malaria was almost eradicated from Tajikistan before independence, but returned in the early 1990s and by 2002, as many as 400,000 cases were

---

<sup>31</sup> National Status Report, 1999; MDG Report 2003.

<sup>32</sup> Entre Nous, UNFPA/ WHO, Rima Stepanova et al., 2002.

<sup>33</sup> Rapid Assessment of current RH facilities, 2000.

<sup>34</sup> National Nutrition Survey Tajikistan, May/June 2002, Action Against Hunger/ECHO.

<sup>35</sup> Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS) 2000, UNICEF.

<sup>36</sup> SCF-US Survey on Breastfeeding, April 2003.

<sup>37</sup> Expanded Programme of Immunization.



estimated,<sup>38</sup> including an increasing incidence of falciparum malaria cases, particularly in border districts with Afghanistan. The increase in malaria morbidity can be attributed to population movements, particularly the return of Tajik refugees from Afghanistan after the civil war and increases in mosquito breeding grounds close to living areas (a result of blocked irrigation canals and rice cultivation). Malaria is now endemic in border regions with Afghanistan and low-lying areas along the Uzbek and Kyrgyz borders of the Ferghana Valley. Tuberculosis is also on the rise. Improvements in identifying and reporting cases through strengthened national capacities indicate a tripling in the TB mortality rate over the past 10 years. This trend is likely to continue over the next few years. TB affects mostly the 15- to 34-year-old age group.

A number of other infectious diseases are emerging as significant public health concerns, with regular outbreaks of anthrax and brucellosis in cattle and humans. There have been isolated outbreaks on an annual basis of the often-fatal Congo Crimean hemorrhagic fever.

There are considerable problems with the routine epidemiology, surveillance control and referral systems in Tajikistan. Discrepancies between official statistics and independent estimates based on epidemiological studies can be attributed in part to different definitions of health and sickness variables and to the poor case detection capacity of the regional health structures. This is often compounded in times of outbreaks, during which health workers often fear retribution for reporting high levels of morbidity and mortality within their area of responsibility, leading to critical delays in mobilizing a response from the central Ministry of Health and international community.

Increasing adolescent pregnancies, a large number of abortions, a significant growth in the prevalence of sexually transmitted illnesses (STIs) and overall poor health characterize women's health status in Tajikistan. The total abortion rate is high and may account for more than 10% of maternal mortality. Birth intervals tend to be short. Some two thirds of women experience intervals of no more than two years, causing additional stress to the mothers' physical and emotional well being.<sup>39</sup> Almost 40% of all deliveries take place in the home, 90% in rural areas.<sup>40</sup> Women have babies at home largely due to a lack of money for hospital care and a lack of transportation. As there are no data on home deliveries, it is impossible to analyze their safety.

There were 92 officially reported cases of HIV infection as of September 2003, but UNAIDS estimates the true number to be 20 times higher. Very little testing has been done, and no reliable surveillance system for HIV has been developed. A laboratory system for testing the safety of donor blood is also not in place. Antiretroviral treatments for HIV-AIDS are not currently available. Intravenous drug use is thought to be the major source of HIV transmission, with UN data suggesting 80% of the 55,000 estimated drug users being opiate users (mostly heroin) and some 70% of this group being injecting drug users.<sup>41</sup> A number of needle exchange programmes exist to serve this group, but with limited national coverage. Other at-risk groups include the large number of labour migrants, the growing number of commercial sex workers and young people in general, who have limited awareness of the dangers of HIV and STIs.

Health expenditure as a percentage of GDP dropped from an already low 2.3% in 1994 to 1.0% in 2001, in contrast to the 5% target figure advocated by WHO. The financial constraints and ineffective health finance management and services -- including pharmaceutical services and routine immunization programme -- have resulted in heavy dependence on external assistance. In 2002, almost \$20 million was invested in health sector programmes through IFIs and international organizations.<sup>42</sup>

## **2. What is being done**

A change in administration in the Ministry of Health in early 2003 is improving relationships with the UN and NGO communities. A health care reform project known as the Somoni plan and a national concept paper foresee several reform initiatives in primary healthcare. The Somoni plan is now being revisited, together with other pilot projects in primary healthcare and family medicine supported by the IFIs. These projects build on the 1997 "Health Care Reform" paper and complement several programmes and declarations made from 2000 onwards. The reform paper briefly mentions the need that "citizens share responsibility for their health," which indeed should be encouraged. Proposed constitutional amendments call for modification of the guarantee of free healthcare for all, but no formal cost recovery systems are yet in place. Since 1997, the

---

<sup>38</sup> WHO 2002.

<sup>39</sup> Tajikistan Country Population Assessment, UNFPA, 1999, p. 22.

<sup>40</sup> Rapid Assessment of current RH facilities, services, equipment and RH commodities, 2000, p. 70.

<sup>41</sup> MDG Report, 2003.

<sup>42</sup> Executive Administration of the President, Foreign Aid Report, 2002, p17.

Government has stated its support for family planning and in 2003 it passed a law on reproductive health and rights. While the PRSP states the need to shift from a focus on secondary and tertiary services to primary health care, budget allocations do not currently reflect this.

Across the country, the UN, many international and local NGOs, and the Red Cross/Red Crescent movement are supporting central and regional health authorities at all levels through the provision of training, equipment and consumables, including drugs. Community mobilization initiatives are increasingly becoming a feature of health programmes, particularly in relation to health promotion activities. ADB and ZdravPlus are supporting the Post-Graduate Medical Institute to train Family Doctors. Regular health coordination meetings between agencies and the Ministry of Health provide a forum for coordination, information exchange and advocacy.

Recent debate has led to the Government's acceptance of the international live birth definition (LBD), with pilot projects being launched in 2003 to demonstrate its validity and practical application. By the end of 2004, the international LBD should be fully operational in pilot areas with the support of the UN and other international organizations. This will be complemented by a causal analysis of infant mortality, which the Ministry of Health is undertaking in 2003 with UN support, aiming at more strategic interventions to reduce mortality.

With UN and WB support, a Ministry of Health working group elaborated clinical guidelines for PHC staff, containing 20 treatment protocols.

Some steps have been taken to address micronutrient deficiency disorders. In December 2002, a law on salt iodization was ratified by Parliament. It prescribes that all salt for human and animal consumption be iodized at a quality level. It prohibits the import and export of un-iodized salt. Wheat flour fortification efforts were intensified in 2002 with international support. A pre-mix including iron, zinc, thiamine, riboflavin, niacin and folic acid has been developed, and regulatory norms are being put into place in 2003. In addition, a National Vitamin A Deficiency Prevention Programme and a parallel National Programme for Anaemia Prevention and Control are being developed in 2003. Supplementation with vitamin A is being introduced through the National Immunization Days in 2003 and routine immunization in 2004.

Initial Government efforts to eradicate malaria are now being dropped in favour of improving population access to quality diagnostic and treatment services to reduce mortality and allow for rapid treatment. While significant anti-malaria treatment and prevention measures have been conducted with support from the international community, the national malaria control system remains weak. Financial resources for combating malaria are limited, and a shift towards case management at a primary healthcare level is required. The Government approved a special anti-TB programme in 2002, based on the WHO standard Directly Observed Treatment Short-course (DOTS). DOTS is currently available to 13% of the country and is envisaged to be countrywide by 2005.

A National Strategy on the Prevention and Control of HIV/AIDS and STIs was approved in 2002. Aimed at preventing the spread of HIV among youth, injecting drug users, commercial sex workers, migrants, soldiers and prisoners, it also provides for the safety of donated blood and the prevention of mother-to-child transmission of HIV. Some activities in the plan have already begun, with the support of the UN and other partners involved in providing needle exchange services and lifestyle education to youth groups. The confirmation of US\$2.4 million from the Global Fund for AIDS, TB and Malaria will give much needed financial support to the established programme.

### **3. Conclusions**

The alarming trends of high mortality and morbidity, malnutrition and micronutrient deficiency disorders, and increasing STI and HIV/AIDS rates have two major root causes. The first is access: the state health services' capacity to provide primary and preventive health care is declining. The second cause is weak family capacity: most people live in impoverished conditions and have inadequate knowledge to prevent diseases and exercise proper home care.

Health reform also means a shift from the intensive secondary and tertiary level approach to increasing the quality and access of services at the primary level, along with preventive care. At independence, Tajikistan inherited the standard Soviet health system, which included a large number of hospitals, hospital beds, doctors, nurses and medical technicians. Virtually all medical procedures have been governed by 'prikaz' or Ministerial orders, where any deviation is considered illegal. The system continues to this day, in which many standard procedures require secondary-level in-patient care despite international norms calling for

treatment at a primary or out-patient level. Support is required at all levels of the healthcare system to develop and implement new clinical guidelines to more appropriately address the changing epidemiological and economic situation in the country.

Transition, civil war, sharp economic decline and resource constraints have all contributed to a widening gap between the health care budget and the actual costs of care and services. The Government has expressed its commitment to reforms in the health sector aimed at strengthening preventive and primary health care with the introduction of family medicine, increasing the cost-effectiveness of medical care and encouraging private investments in the health sector. However, such commitment needs to be translated into action, beginning with allocation of resources to strengthen PHC facilities, build capacity of personnel and expand services.

All health care services were officially free until the June 2003 referendum, which allows for eventual charging of fees for services, in response to the inability of the system to provide liveable wages for doctors and other health professionals. This perhaps unavoidable step, unfortunately, further limits access to services by the poor. Allocations to the health sector from the State budget have been declining in recent years. Household poverty often leads patients to self-treat with medication from the local bazaar without medical supervision, and treatment courses are often not followed to completion. More babies are delivered at home unattended, resulting in higher infant and maternal mortality rates.

Poverty impacts directly on the nutritional status of the population. The lack of access to information and knowledge about preventive care, to resources that would provide better hygienic conditions, and to health care services are also implicit in the overall impact of poverty. For example, many infant lives could be saved through improved knowledge by caregivers on early recognition of disease and infection and their awareness of seeking care at an earlier stage of illness.<sup>43</sup>

Enhancing the capacity of health care professionals and the health care institutions remains a challenge. Although upgrading the frequently weak professional skills of health workers is undertaken by a number of international organizations, little systematic in-service training exists to ensure sustainable human resource development. Additionally, the low salary level for all health professionals has had a demoralizing effect, to the degree that many qualified staff are unable to work full time in their posts and many have left the profession altogether. Incentives for health professionals must be put into place to encourage long-term commitment and service and to prevent them from working part-time or deciding on another profession.

Increased decentralization and strengthening of PHC services will improve access to health care particularly in poor rural areas. It requires capacity building of local government to increase their accountability in health services. Strengthening the capacity of PHC centres will need to include referral systems for patients and data, along with increasing the deployment of qualified health personnel in hard-to-reach rural areas. Promoting cost-effective health care should be part of an overall rationalization effort that would examine human resource development, training and management, supply of medicines and financing of the health sector.

The health management information system, along with morbidity and mortality surveillance, is not effectively functioning, so that even the limited resources within the sector are not allocated and managed efficiently. A sustainable data collection and analysis mechanism must be functional to help ensure more effective curative and preventive care to all, particularly the poor. An efficient and effective surveillance system would also detect threats of disease outbreak and a wide-spread increase in HIV/AIDS and STIs.

With the Government's acceptance of the international live birth definition, support must be given for its application beyond the current pilot projects. This scheme has to accompany improvements in the registration and reporting system so that mortality and morbidity rates are properly monitored. This requires advocacy for removal of the birth registration fee and standardization of birth registration procedures with the relevant government agencies. Data collection is also needed to improve monitoring of HIV/AIDS infection cases in the country. Anonymous testing in strategic locations needs to be set up for monitoring of at-risk groups.

---

<sup>43</sup> Infant Morality Causal Analysis in Khatlon and Dushanbe using Verbal Autopsy to Assess the Path to Death, Ministry of Health and UNICEF 2002.

## G. ENVIRONMENT

### 1. Situation analysis

With water, electricity and gas provided virtually free to household and commercial consumers under the Soviet system, no sense of price, opportunity cost or understanding that these commodities are scarce resources developed in Tajikistan. Likewise, unsustainable practices inherited from the Soviet era, such as over-intensive cotton production, continue to negatively affect the country's land and water resources. One result is serious environmental degradation; dilapidated or destroyed irrigation networks and gas and electricity supplies; and insecure land tenure. Desertification and high soil salinity, deforestation, and overgrazing are some of the problems that must be addressed. No commitment to long-term care for natural resources and little knowledge of conservation complicate the situation.

Other contributing causes to environmental degradation are weak or outdated natural resource planning and management and an inadequate legal framework. To make matters worse, more than 20, often over-specialized, agencies have responsibilities for environmental management. The Ministry of Nature Protection lacks capacity to properly oversee all these agencies or to develop a holistic strategy. Continued shortfalls in budget allocations have led to low staff salaries and morale, and a lack of communication and information sharing between central, regional and local bodies.

Environmental monitoring is limited as budget constraints make it impossible for ministries and agencies to purchase modern equipment and reference materials, which in turn leads to a lack of enforcement of existing regulations. Pollution from municipal, agricultural, industrial and domestic sources of untreated waste, as well as a lack of awareness among the population of hygiene and sanitation standards pose serious health risks. In Khatlon, for example, typhoid fever is on the rise due to poor hygienic conditions and practices. The proliferation of informal garbage dumps has also lead to widespread contamination of surface and groundwater.

Improved disaster management is required. Tajikistan frequently suffers from earthquakes, landslides, mudflows, floods and avalanches, which have a devastating impact on impoverished rural communities. However, addressing these dangers is inhibited by a lack of capacity in the Ministry of Emergency Situations and weak communication and transport infrastructures in remote areas.

Nonetheless, there are numerous opportunities to harness environmental resources for development, in particular, Tajikistan's vast water reserves. Small-scale hydropower is the most viable option for the short to medium term given the country's abundance of water, its relatively low cost and existing expertise in the field. Other alternative energy sources, such as solar and wind power, should certainly be considered.

### 2. What is being done

In 2002, the ADB identified the key constraints to improving environmental management; they include the inadequate policy and legislative framework; the absence of economic incentives to use natural resources more efficiently; the Government's emphasis on restrictive control rather than facilitative regulation; institutional weaknesses such as organizational structure and shortage of qualified staff; poor communication and data management; inappropriate technical approaches; limited financial resources and inefficient financial arrangements; and a lack of awareness of environmental issues.

Based on this project, the Ministry of Nature Protection has been working to improve efficiency. The Ministry is developing a consensual approach at central and regional levels and has clarified responsibilities on inter-agency coordination and procedures. An emphasis has been placed on building capacity in environmental management and monitoring at the central and local levels through training and the development of an environmental data information system.

The UN has helped the Government analyze the country's priorities and needs for capacity development related to the implementation of three UN Conventions: the UNCBD, UNFCCC and UNCCD. The UN has also helped the Government formulate a National Environmental Action Plan (NEAP) and the National Sustainable Development Report. A central element in the national strategies is the mobilization of domestic resources for environmental issues. To raise awareness, a public information campaign was conducted both at the national and local levels.

The work both of the UN and the Government, notably the National Sustainable Development Commission, is directly linked to efforts to integrate sustainable development into official policies and to reverse the loss of environmental resources. In national assessments and especially in the preparation of the National Agenda

21 Report for the WSSD,<sup>44</sup> all existing national programmes and plans were reviewed and concrete recommendations were made on integrating sustainable development perspectives.

To strengthen the capacity and role of civil society in decision-making processes, the OSCE and the UN are facilitating the implementation of the Aarhus Convention. Current legislation will be reviewed to bring it in line with the Convention and international standards on environmental sustainability. A joint initiative called “Environment and Security” is supported by the OSCE and the UN. It facilitates cooperation on environmental issues across borders and provides a framework for vulnerability assessments, monitoring environment and security linkages, developing policy, and undertaking capacity building, institutional development and advocacy.

The UN has assisted the Central Asian countries in developing the Regional Environmental Action Plan (REAP). The REAP focuses on air and water pollution, land degradation, waste management and mountain ecosystems. It highlights the importance of public participation at the regional level.

With UN support, the Government is establishing “core” protected areas of biodiversity to secure long-term protection and to promote the efficient and sustainable use of natural resources by local populations, specifically in the Hissar Mountains. The World Bank has started a project on “Community Watershed Development” to help prevent land degradation and desertification and to protect biodiversity through community-based conservation activities. The aim is to improve the quality of irrigated land and pastures, and to encourage tree-planting to stem soil erosion.

The National Concept for Rational Water Resource Use and Protection foresees the strengthening of regional cooperation on water management, for example on regulating the river flows. Other key elements include the introduction of water saving technology, particularly in the agriculture sector; utilizing the hydropower potential of small rivers; and establishing environmental standards for the use of groundwater reserves.

Disaster preparedness was addressed in 2000 through the founding of the Rapid Emergency Assessment and Co-ordination Team (REACT), consisting of UN agencies, international NGOs, the IFRC, and the Ministry of Emergency Situations. This group has provided coordinated assessment and response to natural disasters, with routine sharing of logistics and assessment data. However, the Ministry of Emergency is still largely response-oriented. REACT has coordinated international assistance to support the mitigation, preparedness and prevention branches of the Ministry. REACT has received support from ECHO’s Disaster Preparedness funds, has been involved in regional cross-border programmes with Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan. Building on this, the UN initiated a Disaster Risk Management Capacity Building programme, which includes community-based projects to reduce disaster risk in selected high-risk communities.

### **3. Conclusions**

The need for reform in the environmental sector is clear. The number of official bodies with environmental responsibilities perhaps should be reduced. Coordination and information flows need to be enhanced and environmental issues should be mainstreamed into national and regional planning across sectors such as health and education. Understanding of the environmental dimensions of their sectors by various Government bodies needs to be improved. Various environmental strategies and action plans need to be consolidated.

The management of natural resources should be made more transparent, with local and central governments held accountable for results. The UN has the experience to push for an integrated approach to achieve a more effective and equitable use of water resources. It can promote a more participatory approach, which will also assist various authorities to implement existing regulations more coherently and effectively.

Environmentally sound practices can be integrated into local economic development, by highlighting both efficiency gains and sustainability. Privatization would also help in building both material ownership and more direct interest in preserving scarce resources. A fee-paying system for consumers should be promoted despite the difficulty in achieving the necessary behavioural changes and the overall poverty of the population. Reform of the network of protected areas around the country is vital and depends on the involvement of local communities.

---

<sup>44</sup> World Summit on Sustainable Development, Johannesburg, 2002.

Information about the environment and non-renewable and renewable energy sources must be made available to the population. People should also have access to renewable energy technologies (biomass conversion, solar collectors, wind power) in both rural and urban areas. Small-scale hydro-power projects could be encouraged. The UN will continue to support access to sustainable irrigation and the rehabilitation of drainage canals to reduce soil salinity and to combat desertification.

Local environmental initiatives should result in properly targeted interventions. One relevant example is the pricing of water and Water Users Associations (WUAs). The WUAs promote voluntary compliance, strengthen community-based monitoring and encourage the enforcement of environmental regulations. Decentralized environmental management will have to be increased to complement the work being undertaken at central government level.

Capacity building is essential for government officials at central and local levels and for the population as a whole. A cadre of authorities trained in issues such as desertification, sound logging practices, proper disposal of waste, the rational use of water and fee payment schemes for irrigation and potable water should be developed over the next few years. Parallel to this, raising awareness amongst rural and urban communities would be a first step towards increased capacity of all stakeholders in the country.

Reliable and comprehensive data on environmental issues are almost non-existent, due both to gaps in data collection and outmoded data management. Considerable attention will have to be given to building the analytical capacities of the Government on climate change, environmental degradation, and pollution. The link between data analysis and policy development is weak and needs urgent attention.

## H. REGIONAL COOPERATION

### 1. Situation analysis

Cooperation is vital for all countries in the region, especially for small, landlocked but water-rich Tajikistan. The former Soviet Union created boundaries in the Central Asian Republics with the intention of reinforcing mutual dependence, and the borders and structures of the current states are not rooted in a history of independent statehood. A common understanding of the interconnectedness of the issues the region faces and a willingness to agree on finding common solutions are indispensable. Because the five Central Asian countries have been following divergent political paths, reaching agreement and implementing concrete measures have been difficult.

Borders drawn in the Soviet era merely demarcated administrative zones. When the borders became international, issues immediately arose related to the interconnected nature of infrastructure, namely rail, road, water and power networks. Sections of the borders between Tajikistan and neighbouring Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan are still contentious, creating complications for border officials and local populations in their daily lives.

Other issues transcend borders and require urgent attention. Poor border management and poverty have resulted in increased crime related to drug trafficking from Afghanistan. The drug trade bears high social costs, with drug abuse on the rise and HIV/AIDS threatening to spread rapidly among intravenous drug users. The health system is unable to offer treatment to addicts seeking help and general awareness of HIV/AIDS prevention is low among the high-risk groups which include intravenous drug users, labour migrants, commercial sex workers and youth.

Paradoxically, while the borders are porous for those engaged in illicit activities (smuggling of arms and drugs and trafficking of humans), those seeking to engage in lawful trade must travel through border checkpoints and are often hindered by burdensome customs and visa regulations. Legitimate trade between Tajikistan and its neighbours is obstructed by systemic problems such as corruption, complex and vague customs regulations, excessive documentation requirements and controls at checkpoints, as well as repeated border closures. This impedes the free and easy movement of people and goods, limiting cross-border trade and communications.<sup>45</sup>

The Government has begun reform of the Committee of State Border Protection.<sup>46</sup> It will have a lead coordination role with the Customs Office (under the Ministry of Tax and Revenues), Airport and Railway Security (under the Ministry of Transport), police (under the Ministry of Internal Affairs), and officials from the Drug Control Agency, Ministry of Security and other institutions. Efforts to modernize the system have been hampered by the lack of funds, low human capacity and overlap of the functions of the many government bodies involved. As salaries are so low, officials are tempted to take advantage of easy opportunities for extortion.

Central Asia's water resources are a major cause of tension among the five Central Asian states. Agriculture is a key source of employment and foreign exchange and each state has sought to increase its share of the waters of the region. Existing interstate coordination bodies have so far been unable to manage the situation successfully. Overall weak management of the region's water resources; poor irrigation techniques and depleted irrigation infrastructure; salinization of soils; and a growing population all place pressure on the governments to introduce immediate changes. There is widespread agreement that the current water crisis is mainly a crisis of water governance – existing political, social, economic and administrative systems are unable to regulate the development and management of provision of water to downstream countries in exchange for provision of energy to upstream countries, including coordination within different sectors within each country.

### 2. What is being done

The Government has undertaken efforts to strengthen drug control through the Drug Control Agency (DCA) and is promoting coordination among the national law enforcement agencies. It has taken steps to strengthen

---

<sup>45</sup> World Bank, *Trade, Transport and Telecommunications in the South Caucasus: Current Obstacles to Regional Cooperation*, 2001, p.90.

<sup>46</sup> The Committee of State Border Protection was established in 1997, as an offshoot of the Ministry of Security.

border control by Russian troops and Tajik border guards.<sup>47</sup> These efforts have shown results in increased seizures of drugs. Tajikistan is responsible for roughly 80% of all drugs confiscated in Central Asia and stands third worldwide in seizures of heroin and raw opium. Still, more must be done to stem the flow of drugs from Afghanistan.

Increased attention to international security has prompted the international community to pay more attention to Tajikistan's porous borders. Over the next three years, the US Government plans to invest over USD 22 million in Central Asia, and the EU has earmarked EUR 18 million to enhance regional border management. The Border Management in Central Asia Programme launched by the EU will support the development of harmonized and coordinated border management at the regional level. The UN is implementing capacity-building and coordination activities under this programme.

Organized crime overall and the drug trade in particular are clearly transnational, requiring an internationally coordinated response. The Government has fully adopted this view and is actively seeking to cooperate with international partners on both the organizational and operational levels.

A number of international agreements, including the Memorandum of Understanding on Regional Drug Control and the Shanghai Cooperation Organization, provide a political basis for cooperation. Tajikistan has established a range of bilateral drug control programmes, among others with the US and France. The Government recently endorsed the Memorandum on Cooperation in Countering Drug Trafficking, which is soon to be signed with Afghanistan. Law enforcement agencies have been cooperating with a number of international partners, above all the Russian troops deployed on the border with Afghanistan. Cooperation with Afghan border units has also begun. The 2000 UNODC Needs Assessment concluded that professional psychologists and social workers must be trained and affordable treatment provided, if drug demand is to be reduced.

The Environment and Security Initiative (ESI) supported by OSCE and the UN aims to facilitate a framework for cooperation on environmental issues across borders and promote peace and stability through environmental cooperation and sustainable development. The Initiative will raise awareness of the linkages between environment and security by mapping risks as well as needs and opportunities for environmental cooperation. The ESI aims to improve sustainable resource management, crisis prevention and peace promotion by creating networks among stakeholder groups and external donors. Other institutions involved are NATO's Science for Peace Programme, the OECD, and the UNECE.

Regional mechanisms, such as the Shanghai Cooperation Organization, International Fund to Save the Aral Sea (IFAS), the UN Special Programme for Economies of Central Asia (SPECA) and the Central Asian Cooperation Organization, are used by the five countries to discuss transport and transit, infrastructure and foreign investment issues. Unfortunately, however, the IFAS has been unable to generate effective cooperative solutions.

The UN has supported water management programmes in Central Asia, but much more needs to be done. The scope and technical complexity of these issues require a coordinated response from the international community and all five Central Asian governments. A proposal by the Governments to create a "special UN commission" must be thoroughly reviewed, as the fundamental issues are governance and political process.

## **Conclusions**

As it tackles the challenge of border management, the Government needs to strike a balance between security concerns and controlling drug trafficking and overcoming the country's economic isolation. Three international airports, 5,000 km of borders and 27 cross-border checkpoints with Afghanistan, China, Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan must be considered in a reform process that will address labour migration, drug and human trafficking, visa requirements, the landmines along the Uzbek-Tajik and Tajik-Afghan borders and other issues. The UN and other actors such as the OSCE and EU will support Government efforts.

---

<sup>47</sup> The Russian Border Guard Service has retained partial responsibility for managing the southern border with Afghanistan.



Reform in the customs and tariff systems is vital for the development of trade and would make the shared borders more manageable and transparent. Accession of the Central Asian countries to the World Trade Organization (WTO) would facilitate the development of regional trade, investment and economic cooperation. Accelerating Tajikistan's access to WTO, supported by UNITAR, is thus crucial. The SPECA under the UN Economic Commissions and ESCAP promote foreign direct investment in the sub-region.

Reform in the customs sector would assist the development of SMEs, which currently have little marketing expertise and low capacity to export their goods. They would benefit from more transparency, better access to information on existing regulatory frameworks, and reliable, trustworthy banking institutions. Further, trade would benefit from better access to reliable means of transportation and information on trade and customs regulations in the neighbouring countries.

The UN's Silk Road Area Development Programme is one of the few regional programmes that links Central Asia with China. The first phase facilitated working-level regional and sub-regional efforts to improve cooperation in transit, trade and customs. A second phase of the programme is under consideration.

Tajikistan shares the Ferghana Valley with Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan. It is home to more than one fifth of the total population of Central Asia. The need for community-level conflict prevention is great in this fertile valley, where disagreement over access to resources has led to tensions at the community level. The UN offices in Tajikistan and Kyrgyzstan as well as other agencies and NGOs should continue to support community-level conflict prevention and local government capacity-building.

The main training needs are related to customs officials and border guards. Border officials need to be instructed on the importance of smooth cross-border traffic and trade, while keeping in mind the need to fight trafficking of narcotics and human beings. A main obstacle to overcome is the lack of leadership by officials in central governments. Strong emphasis also needs to be placed on informing Tajik labour migrants on human rights and HIV/AIDS prevention. The UN can assist countries in sharing their experience and can facilitate capacity-building on a regional or sub-regional level on issues such as fiscal decentralization, anti-corruption measures and national ICT strategies.

Data on cross-border trade and traffic are not collected consistently and consequently are not reliable. There is a need to harmonize and standardize data collection on trade, transport and visas. This is especially relevant taking into consideration the vast scale of labour migration, including the major role the income sent by Tajik migrant workers to their families plays in the every-day life of the Tajik people. UN support for improved data collection and analysis will also be important for water-sharing agreements and prevention of or response to natural disasters.

### III. Areas of Cooperation

Poverty lies at the heart of the challenges facing Tajikistan. For over a decade, the UN and other organizations responded to the pressing poverty and other needs in Tajikistan largely from a humanitarian perspective. However, the 2002 PRSP, the MDG Report, this CCA, the forthcoming UNDAF and other strategic documents signal a fundamental shift in the development climate.

Based on the Millennium Development Goals, the UN system has an inherent mandate in reducing poverty, hunger, and gender disparity, improving education and health and promoting environmental stability. Fundamentally, the work of the UN is rooted in *human rights*. Increased drug and human trafficking and continued high labour migration, compounded by shortfalls in education, health, land reform and other areas, give rise to real concerns about *human security*. The UN system must ensure that in all its dealings with Government and civil society, measures are taken to prevent or resolve conflict, thereby working to ensure human security. Women are at a disadvantage in several areas, including the political decision-making process, access to land and employment and in health and education. The UN system will therefore ensure that *gender* issues are considered in all its interventions.

With these three cross-cutting issues in mind, five significant development challenges emerged from the analysis. These are:

- Ø Access – to information, services, assets and decision making;
- Ø Reform of institutions – of Government, but also civil society structures;
- Ø Decentralization – of decision making and control over financial and other resources;
- Ø Capacity building – of individuals, institutions and other societal structures; and
- Ø Data analysis and evaluation – to provide the quantitative and qualitative information on which to base decisions.

**Ensuring that human rights, human security and gender issues are considered at every step of the move towards an equitable society and just state is a strength of the UN system**

Even after years of joint emergency and development work, the UN system itself is not free of overlapping responsibilities; this compounds the lack of clarity in a sizeable and still growing international community with sometimes disparate mandates. Inexperience, as well as variable analytical and leadership skills in civil society and the political structures further complicate the process.

#### **Why are these major challenges priority areas for the UN?**

The five challenges posed by lack of access and need for institutional reform, decentralization, capacity building and data analysis and evaluation are inextricably linked. Improvements made in one area will have an affect on the others.

**Key development challenges in Tajikistan include access, institutional reform, decentralisation, capacity building and data analysis and evaluation**

Throughout the analysis, **access** emerged as a crucial element in Tajikistan's development. It is a country that faces extreme geographic difficulties, which impede access by the population to markets (jobs, prices, controls, transit regulations), services (health, agriculture, education, legal), decision making (local, regional and national) and information. While the media should be supported to change, both new and traditional ways to provide access to information should be explored. With institutional reform and increased human capacity building, access to services should also improve, thereby facilitating access for the entire population, including

women, youth and children.

A transition from the “command and control” mentality to a facilitative and “service-oriented” approach is the key component to **institutional reform**. There is a need for further reform in all areas: the private sector, the judiciary and legislative branches, social welfare and others. For example, the low level of trust in the judicial system is evident in the small number of civil cases: most people lack confidence that their grievances will be dealt with adequately. The focus on institutionalization as the primary response for vulnerable groups, rather than alternate systems, should be gradually transformed. Another key example is reform of mechanisms that impact on the creation of new businesses. Reform is needed to achieve clarity and reliability in the legal frameworks for registration (birth, death, voter and land), taxation, labour, environmental standards and law enforcement. The mechanisms to review draft legislation should be

strengthened. **Decentralization** is an important element of reform in the public sector, from executive, judicial and legislative structures to education, health, and environment. Rather than describing the process in terms of weakening the centre, decentralization should be seen as an exercise to strengthen the cohesion and improve communication between the central government and regional and local structures, which will reduce the existing fragmentation of the country. Decentralization is closely linked to participation, not only by different levels of government but also of communities and individuals through such mechanisms as Water Users Associations and Parent-Teacher Associations.

The need for **capacity building** exists in every sector to improve skills in analysis, planning, and leadership. In governance, health, education, agriculture and other sectors, capacity building should include not only skills but also attitude change. An attitudinal and behavioural shift from the centralized and often passive “wait-to-be-told” approach to a fresh, innovative, can-do attitude would go far in empowering Government and civil society.

Because of Tajikistan’s protracted multiple transition, effective policy-planning and prioritization depend on progress in **data collection and analysis**, as well as **monitoring and evaluation**. While the capacity to collect data has improved recently, disaggregated data (e.g. by region and gender) should become the norm rather than the exception. More needs to be known about issues such as labour migration and demographics; HIV-AIDS and STIs; education enrolment, and learning achievement; and domestic violence. The main challenge lies in making data more accessible to the public and decision-makers and to present them in flexible formats (e.g. through GIS) to support accurate analysis, planning and evaluation.

The UN system is in a unique position to address all five of these key development challenges; while each agency has a specific mandate and is responsible for its own country programme, the Country Team shares a common vision for a prosperous and healthy Tajikistan. In the MDG report, the President of Tajikistan states, “It is our joint task to preserve our planet for future generations. Our shared concern for the stability and security of a more benign world in the twenty-first century is a good reason for joint efforts to ensure economic development and democracy in all countries, and the happiness and welfare of all nations.”

### **Moving from the CCA to the UNDAF**

Tajikistan has moved onto the fast track in 2003, with the production of its first MDG Report, a successful Consultative Group meeting, and the opening of embassies and new development partner offices. The UN system will continue its support through the UN Development Assistance Framework for 2005 to 2009, to achieve the Millennium Development Goals and other objectives established by the Government and civil society. This document is a first step towards the development framework. The framework moves beyond the standardized terminology used in the analysis above, to highlight the unique combination of factors currently at work in Tajikistan. These factors include its mountainous and sparsely populated terrain; nascent democratic structures; and emerging initiatives at family and community levels in rebuilding their livelihoods. Another distinctive feature is the decline in the decade since independence in several areas of every-day life, from income levels to access to health and education.

These characteristics were formulated as four priority areas for UN System intervention, namely

- Overcoming Mountains;
- Redistributing Responsibilities;
- Transforming Livelihoods; and
- Reversing Declines.

For the five years between 2005 and 2009, the UN System will concentrate its financial and human resources in these four priority areas.

## IV. Indicator Framework

Indicator Framework Indicators in *italics* are MDG indicators. The additional indicators are felt by the UN Country Team to be critical in monitoring progress towards achieving the UNDAF outcomes. Where there is no baseline figure, this indicates that the UN should support Government to collect the data so as to establish a baseline for adequate monitoring of progress and evaluation of programme interventions.

### 1. Governance

Indicator	Data & Comments	Source and Year
<i>Telephone lines per 1,000 people</i>	36	NHDR 2001-2002
<i>Personal computers per 1,000 people</i>	Not available	--
ISP service providers	5	NHDR 2001-2002
# of newspapers (public and private)	203 newspapers (no dailies) 178 public/19 private/5 owned by political parties; distribution limited to major cities	Internews, June 03
# of TV stations	Around 35 stations 78% of people watch Russian TV	NHDR 2000
# of radio	4 stations (3 public, 1 private)	Internews
Criminal procedure code revised	No target date set for revision	
Juvenile justice system	Not yet developed	
# of NGOs or CSOs involved in advocacy, research or political debate	15 to 20	Tajik Legal Consortium, ACT, IREX
Increased transparency in privatization procedures	Under review in 2003	WB
% of land in private use	56% (44% dekhan farms, 4% Presidential land, 8% kitchen plots); the constitution still bans private <i>ownership</i> of land, however	FAO based data from the Land Committee, 2003
Simplified procedures for SMEs (tax structure, visa and travel procedures)	Measurements to be developed	
Deposit mobilization	4% of GDP (Armenia: 9%; Kyrgyzstan: 5%)	IMF, 2003
Commercial bank lending	14% of GDP; 2% excluding cotton (1999: 7% of GDP; 2% excluding cotton)	IMF, 2003

## 2. Poverty

Indicator	Data	Source and Year
<i>Proportion of population below \$1 per day (PPP)</i>	83% below poverty line of USD 2.85/day 33% below USD 1.43/day 17% below USD 1/day	MDG Report
<i>Poverty gap ratio (incidence x depth of poverty)</i>	To be available in 2003 WB Poverty Assessment	
<i>Share of poorest quintile in national consumption</i>	To be available in 2003 WB Poverty Assessment	
<i>Prevalence of underweight children (under five years of age)</i>	30.9% of children 6-59 months suffer from chronic malnutrition	Nat'l Nutrition Survey, AAH 2002
<i>Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption</i>	47%	
Overall unemployment rate	33%	WB
Access to latrines or toilets	97% urban; 88% rural	MICS
# of chronically food-insecure people	1.5 million (23%)	WFP 2002
# of Tajik labour migrants to other countries	500,000 (85% male)	IOM

## 3. People in Need of Special Protection

Indicator	Data	Source and Year
Number of assisted returnees	55,000 (Mostly from 1997 onwards)	UNHCR
# of children in institutions	11,000 under 16 years old	MLSP
# of adults in institutional care	1,000 in psychiatric care	MSF-Holland, 2003
Ratio of children with disabilities in public (mainstream) schools	Not available	--
# of street children	3,000 in Dushanbe, of whom 90% have a home	Zerkalo, 2002
% working children	1% of children 5-15 years of age engaged in paid work 25% of children 5-15 years of age engaged in some type of work	MICS 2000
# of individuals registered as mentally or physically disabled	34,000 < 34 yrs and 19,000 children < 15 yrs	
# of employed individuals with disabilities	100 successful placements out of quota of 722 in 2001	MLSP
# disabled children in public secondary education	15 in 2001/2002	
% of 15-25 year-olds of total population	20%	
% unemployment amongst youth (14-30 years old)	65.5% in 2002	National Programme: Youth of Tajikistan, 2004-2006
% of knowledge on STIs amongst young people	Unknown; RAR underway as of August 2003	
% of knowledge on HIV-AIDS amongst young people	Unknown; RAR underway as of August 2003	
# of female-headed households	70,000	MLSP, 2002
Vulnerability to poverty	Female-headed household: 28.6%	TLSS

	Male-headed household: 21.2%	
# of individuals eligible to receive old-age pension	360,000	MLSP
# of individuals registered for pension or other form of social insurance benefit	557,000	MLSP

#### 4. Education

Indicator	Data/Year/Source	
% of GDP spent in education sector	2.6%	
# of children in pre-school age group	> 1 million (2002)	
% of pre-school age group (ages 3-5) enrolled in public pre-schools	<b>1999</b>	<b>2000</b>
	16	5.5
# of state-supported pre-school institutions nationally	496 (2002) (MOE)	
<i>Net enrolment ratio in primary education</i>	<b>1989</b>	<b>2002</b>
	94.3%	77.7% (PRSP)
<i>% of pupils starting grade 1 who reach grade 5</i>	96% (2002-2003) (NPA on EFA, MOE)	
% gross enrolment in upper secondary education	<b>1992</b>	<b>1999</b>
	69%	31%
% of students completing 11 years of schooling	<b>Girls</b>	<b>Boys</b>
	36.7% (2001)	63.3% (2001)
% adult literacy	<b>1989</b>	<b>2000</b>
	99.8% (male) 99.6% (female)	99.8% (male) 99.8% (female) (SSA)
<i>Literacy rate of 15-24 year olds</i>	95% of people 15 years old and older (WG on Girls' Ed)	
Average teacher salary	USD 7 per month (MDGR)	
Number of institutions of higher learning	35	
Drop-out rate in primary education	Unknown	
Learning achievement rate	Unknown nationally <sup>48</sup>	
% of primary schools with heating, clean water and sanitation	Unknown nationally; Ministry of Education estimates 60% of all education institutions require basic rehabilitation	
Availability of textbooks	49 of 168 essential textbooks available in 2002	
# of Parent-Teacher Associations	Unknown nationally; some pilot projects being carried out, with 19% of schools with PTAs	

<sup>48</sup> See UNICEF/UNESCO MLA Study 2002 for more details.

## 5. Gender

Indicator	Data/Year		
% of boys and girls in primary, secondary and higher education.		1991/1992	2001/2002
	Grades 1-4	51.20% boys 48.80% girls	51.90% boys 48.10% girls
	Grades 5-9	50.90% boys 49.10% girls	53.70% boys 46.30% girls
	Grades 10-11	50.20% boys 49.80% girls	66.40% boys 33.60% girls
	Higher education	66.40% men 33.60% women	75.70% men 24.30% women
	Source: SSC, Nat'l Thematic Group on Girls' Education, 2003		
	Data	Source/Year	
Ratio of literate females to males, 15to24-year-olds	Not available		
Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector	Not available		
Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament.	15%	UNTOP 2003	
Labour force participation rate of women	47.6% of females in the paid labour force	World Bank 2000	
Average monthly wages of women and men	Women: USD 7 Men: USD 10	SSC 2001	
# of marriages under 18	Not available		
# of girls and women trafficked	1,000 in 2001	IOM 2003	
Number of NGOs focused on gender related issues.	128	G&D 2001	
Proportion of assets (land, credits) accessed by women	Not available		

## 6. Health

Indicator	Data	Source/Year
Under-5 Mortality Rate	126	MICS, 2000
Infant Mortality Rate	27.9/89	2001 (MOH)/MICS
% of 1-year-old children immunized against measles	97%	MOH, 2001
Maternal Mortality Ratio	50.6	MOH, 2002
% of births attended by skilled health personnel	39.7	UNFPA, 2000
% of homes births	39.7	UNFPA, 2000
Contraceptive prevalence rate	34.6%	UNFPA, 2000
Abortion rate per 1,000 live births	144.5	Republican Centre of Medical Statistics and Information, 2001
% of babies < six months of age officially registered	Less than 50%	MICS, 2000
Proportion of population with access to affordable essential drugs on a sustainable basis	Unknown	
Prevalence and death rates associated with malaria	30,000-50,000 cases of	MDGR

## Moving Mountains – A UN Assessment of Development in Tajikistan

	P. falciparum countrywide	
<i>Prevalence and death rates associated with TB</i>	64 cases per 100,000 9.7 deaths per 100,000	2002
<i>Proportion of TB cases detected and cured under DOTS</i>	78% of new smear cases	2003
% of country covered by DOTS	13%	MDGR
% of population with access to information about HIV-AIDS	Unknown; one study of 400 youth revealed that 68% have “low knowledge on HIV/AIDS”	
Ratio of HIV diagnostic facilities/population	Some 25 facilities nationally do diagnosis in 2003	
Average health worker monthly salary	US\$ 2.50	MoH
Brucellosis cases per 100,000 people	17.9	MDGR
Typhoid cases per 100,000 people	52.2	MDGR
Hepatitis cases per 100,000 people	130.3	MDGR

## 7. Environment

Indicators	Data	Source
<i>Proportion of land area covered by forest</i>	2.1%	NHDR 2003
<i>% of total protected land area (of national area)</i>	4.2%	SSC 2001
<i>Land area protected to maintain biological diversity</i>	2.96 million hectares	SSC 2001
<i>GDP per unit of energy use</i>	0.127 (2000)	SSC 2001
<i>Carbon dioxide emissions per capita</i>	900	UNFFC 2001
<i>Proportion of population with access to piped water</i>	56% overall, 30% in rural areas. 30% of tested samples did not comply with health norms.	MDGR 2003
Total with sanitary means of excreta disposal	89.9%	MICS 2000
<i>Proportion of people with access to secure tenure</i>	Not available	
Total government spending on environment	USD 697,000 (2000)	SSC 2001
Treated wastewater	Of 51 treatment facilities, 12 operate satisfactorily, 26 poorly and 13 are non-operational	National Programme to Combat Desertification, Dushanbe, 2001
Arable land affected by desertification	50,000 ha annually are affected; 5,000 ha/annually go out of agric. use as a result of salting	National Sustainable Development Report RIO+10, 2002
Glacier melt	35% decrease between 1949 and 2000	Kharitasoz Mapping Research Centre

## 8. Regional Cooperation

Indicator	Data	Source/Year
Amount of drugs passing through Tajikistan	48 metric tons of heroin, from Afghanistan	UNODC, 2003
Seizures of opiates	1996 – 6 kg	UNODC, 2003



*Moving Mountains* – A UN Assessment of Development in Tajikistan

	2001 – 4,239 kg	
Drug users	55,000	UNODC, 2003
Flow entitlements	11 %	NHDR 2003
Regional agreements on hydropower development	Though these indicators are more qualifiable than quantifiable, they can serve as important measures of progress in Tajikistan and throughout Central Asia. Improvements in their development and implementation should be monitored.	
Transport infrastructure improved		
Regional trade agreements		
Trade volume with neighbouring countries		

## **V. Sources**

- Action Against Hunger/ECHO, “National Nutrition Survey: Tajikistan,” June 2002
- ACTED/UNICEF, “School Sanitation and Hygiene Promotion Project,” 2001
- ADB, “Agricultural Sector Assessment Project,” 2000
- ADB, Country Report: Woman and Gender Relations in Tajikistan, 2000
- ADB, “Pedagogy Renewal Project: Tajikistan Education Reform,” July 2002
- Association of University Degree Women, Girls’ Education in Tajikistan: Education, Problems and Solutions, 2002
- CARE, “Project to Reduce Violence Against Women in Bokhtar, Vakhsh and Yavan,” 2000
- Gender and Development, Directory of Women’s NGOs, 2001
- GoT, Government Decree #199, “About Girls’ Higher Education, in accordance with the President’s quota for 2001-2005,” 19 April 2001.
- GoT, “Law on State Budget of the Republic of Tajikistan for 2003.”
- GoT, “National Strategy on HIV/AIDS Prevention in the Republic of Tajikistan 2002-2005,” 2002
- GoT, Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, 2002
- GoT, Progress toward the Millennium Development Goals in the Republic of Tajikistan, 2003
- GoT, Executive Administration of the President, Aid Coordination Unit, Foreign Aid Report, 2002
- GoT, Ministry of Education, “State Programme on the Development of the Education Sector 2003 to 2010,” 2003
- GoT, Ministry of Education and UNICEF, “Education for All: Assessment on Republic of Tajikistan,” 2000
- GoT, Ministry of Education, Save the Children Foundation–UK, and UNICEF, “Report on Community-Based Education Management Information System, (c-EMIS)”, 2003
- GoT, Ministry of Education, in cooperation with Republican Education Fund, Centre for Public Opinion Studies and Forecast, UNESCO and UNICEF, “Monitoring Learning Achievements in Education and Problems of Non-Attendance in Tajikistan”, 2002
- GoT, Ministry of Health and Kazakhstan Academy of Nutrition, “Vitamin A Study in Khatlon,” 2002
- GoT, Ministry of Labour and Social Protection
- GoT, Ministry of Nature Protection and UNDP, “The First National Communication of the Republic of Tajikistan under the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change,” 2002
- GoT, Ministry of Nature Protection, Ozone Centre
- GoT, State Statistical Agency and the Office of the President, in cooperation with the World Bank and UNDP, “Tajikistan Livings Standards Survey,” for the Republic of Tajikistan, Poverty Assessment, 1999.
- GoT, State Statistical Agency, “Men and Women of Tajikistan,” 2002
- GoT, State Statistics Committee, as provided to National Thematic Group on Girls’ Education for its report to the CARK Education Forum, 2003
- Human Rights Watch, Human Rights Watch World Report, 2003
- IMF, Country Report N03/5, January 2003
- International Crisis Group, “Tajikistan; a Roadmap for Development”, ICG Asia Report N51, April 2003
- IOM, Deceived Migrants from Tajikistan. A study of trafficking in women and children, 2001
- IOM and “SHARK” Scientific and Research Centre, Labour Migration from Tajikistan, 2003
- National Coordination Committee on HIV/AIDS/STI: “Follow-up to the Declaration of Commitment on HIV/AIDS (UNGASS),” 2003
- National Reproductive Health Centre
- National Sustainable Development Commission of Tajikistan, “National Sustainable Development Report,” Dushanbe, 2002

- Open Asia Society, “Tradition and Modernity: Study on Polygamy,” 2002
- Save the Children-US, “Expanding Maternal and Child Health and Reproductive Health Services in Uzbekistan and Tajikistan: Report of the Baseline Assessment, Khatlon Oblast, Tajikistan,” April 2003
- UNDP, Tapping the Potential: Improving Water Management in Tajikistan, National Human Development Report, 2003
- UNDP, Water resources management in Central Asia. Future strategy and role, Mission report, September 2001
- UNESCO/UNICEF, Monitoring Learning Achievements/Non-Attendance and Dropout Study (MLA/NADO), 2002
- UNFPA, Demographic Survey, 2002
- UNFPA, “A rapid assessment of current reproductive health facilities, services, equipment and commodities,” 2000
- UNFPA and Gender and Development, “KAP Assessment on Reproductive Health,” 2002
- UNFPA/WHO, “Entre Nous,” Rima Stepanova et al., 2002
- UNFPA, “Tajikistan: Country Population Assessment,” 1999
- UNICEF, “Children and Family Needs Assessment,” 2001
- UNICEF and the Government of Tajikistan, “Report on the Mid-Term Review of the Country Programme of Cooperation 2000-2004”, October 2002
- UNICEF and Ministry of Health, “Infant Mortality Causal Analysis in Khatlon and Dushanbe, Using Verbal Autopsy to Assess the Path to Death,” Unpublished, 2002
- UNICEF, The Status of Women and Children: Tajikistan, Multiple Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS), 2000
- UNICEF, “Women in Transition, CEE/CIS/Baltics,” 1999
- UNICEF, The Right to Quality Education: Creating Child-Friendly Schools in Central Asia, 2002
- UNICEF and others, Reports from II. Education Donors’ Coordination Meeting, 1 March 2003, Dushanbe.
- UNIFEM, “Rural Women Needs Assessment,” 2002
- UNTOP, “Project Implementation Report,” 2002
- WHO, Regional Office for Europe, “Roll-back Malaria,” 2002
- WHO, Regional Office for Europe, Health Care Systems in Transition: Tajikistan,
- WHO pilot survey, “Violence against Women,” conducted by Open Asia with support from SCO, 1999
- World Bank, “Education Sector Review,” forthcoming, 2003
- World Bank, Gender in Transition, 2000
- World Bank, Republic of Tajikistan, Poverty Assessment, Report No. 20285-TJ, 2000
- World Bank, “Profile of Infrastructure and Energy Sector Activities of the World Bank in Europe and Central Asian Region,” July 2002
- World Bank, “Trade, Transport and Telecommunications in the South Caucasus: Current Obstacles to Regional Cooperation,” 2001
- World Bank, Women and Gender Relations in Tajikistan, 2000
- World Food Programme, “Situation Analysis of Food Security in Tajikistan, Baseline Chronic Food Insecurity,” March 2003
- Zerkalo, with support from ORA, “Research on Cases & Predisposing Factors Affecting Street Children, Homeless Children, Children in Institutions and Children with Disabilities in Tajikistan,” 2002